

MA in Translation Studies

Module 5

Research Methods.

Research project: the bilateral English-Spanish-English translation of the conjunctions 'y', 'o', 'and' and 'or' functioning as final-item connectors.

David Roe

Word count minus examples, quotes, appendices and contents page: 4,371.

Contents

1. Introduction	3
2. Method	4
3. Dictionary definitions	5
3.1 The definitions of ‘y’ and ‘and’	5
3.2 The definitions of ‘o’ and ‘or’	6
4. Examples	7
4.1 Examples taken from texts sent by clients	7
Example 1 (taken from an audio guide for a Corot exhibition in Madrid):.....	8
Example 2 (taken from the same audio guide):.....	9
Example 3 (taken from the same audio guide):.....	10
Example 4 (taken from a university course – case study – on business):.....	11
Example 5 (taken from the same course – case study – on business):.....	12
Example 6 (taken from a software manual):.....	13
Example 7 (taken from a press release issued by a leading Spanish business school):.....	14
4.2 Examples taken from texts published by the EU	15
Example 1 (taken from http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/lvb/l28021.htm):.....	15
Example 2 (taken from http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/lvb/n26004.htm):.....	16
Example 3 (taken from http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/lvb/l32101.htm):.....	17
Example 4 (taken from http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/cha/c11309.htm):.....	18
Example 5 (taken from http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/lvb/l24016.htm):.....	19
5. Percentages	19
5.1 Examples from texts sent by clients	19
5.2 Examples from the EU website	20
6. Patterns	20
7. The Spanish point of view	20
Example 1.....	21
Example 2.....	21
Example 3.....	21
Example 5.....	22
Example 6.....	22
Example 7.....	22
8. Conclusion	23
References	28
Appendix 1	29
Examples from texts sent by clients.....	29
Examples of correspondence between the DT and the AT.....	29
Examples of non-correspondence between the DT and the AT.....	34
Appendix 2	36
Examples from the EU website.....	36
Examples of correspondence between the DT and the AT.....	36
Examples of non-correspondence between the DT and the AT.....	42
Appendix 3	44
E-mail to the ASETRAD mailing list and the replies.....	44
Original e-mail and translation.....	44
Questions sent with e-mail and translation.....	45

1. Introduction

Toury (1995: 268) gives two exemplary laws of translation, the first of which he labels “the law of growing standardisation”:

“in translation, textual relations obtaining in the original are often modified, sometimes to the point of being totally ignored, in favour of [more] habitual options offered by a target repertoire”.

He goes on to explain the second law, “the law of interference”, as “phenomena pertaining to the make-up of the source text to be transferred to the target text” (ibid: 275). In this law, he refers to “negative transfer (i.e. deviations from normal, codified practices of the target system)” (ibid: 275) and “positive transfer (i.e. greater likelihood of selecting features which do exist and are used in any case).” (ibid: 275).

This work looks at examples of Toury’s “negative” and “positive” transfer applied to the Spanish conjunctions ‘y’ and ‘o’ and the English conjunctions ‘and’ and ‘or’, together with examples illustrating his law of growing standardisation.

While working as a professional freelance translator I have noticed the occasional need to translate the Spanish connectors ‘y’ and ‘o’ when acting as *final-item connectors* in a way that disagrees with the suggestions made by widely used and accepted bilingual dictionaries and resources. This has led to research into the Spanish-English translation of the various occurrences of said terms in texts sent for translation by clients during the last year (July 2004 to June 2005) and in English-Spanish texts published on the Internet by the EU.

On a more academic note, the inclusion in this work of a lower number of quotes from external sources than might be expected is due to the specific nature of the work itself.

2. Method

The first part of the work looks at examples from texts sent for Spanish-English translation by clients during the last year. For the examples to qualify for the work, the list had to include at least three items and the final item had to be connected by either ‘y’ or ‘o’.

To obtain a wider view of the translation of *final-item connectors* and see whether or not professional English-Spanish translators had also translated the terms ‘y’, ‘o’, ‘and’, ‘or’ in ways that differ from dictionary suggestions, the second stage looks at documents published by the EU.

Finally, because the analyses of the Spanish texts have been made from the point of view of a native English-speaker and are consequently open to misinterpretation and interference, explanations for the use of the Spanish conjunctions were sought from native Spanish linguists in order to confirm whether or not said use was appropriate and to reveal possible areas of further study. To do this, an e-mail was sent to the ASETRAD (Asociación Española de Traductores e Intérpretes) mailing list; the details of the message and the specific replies are given in Appendix 3.

Throughout the work, I have abbreviated the terms *source text/language* and *target text/language* to the commonplace ST/SL and TT/TL, and used the common abbreviations of ES for Spanish and EN for English; DT and AT stand for *Dictionary Translation* and

Actual Translation, respectively. I have also underlined the list and marked the *final-item connector* in bold lettering in each example.

3. Dictionary definitions

3.1 The definitions of ‘y’ and ‘and’

The *Diccionario de la Lengua Española* (henceforth, the DRAE), which is drawn up and published by Spain’s Real Academia de la Lengua - the most widely accepted authority on the language - defines the Spanish term ‘y’ as follows (my translation):

“copulative conjunction whose purpose is to join words or clauses affirmatively. When several words or items on the list are to be joined, it is generally used before the last one.”

This definition suggests that the Spanish connector ‘y’ is appropriate for connecting items on a list where said items are not exclusive options but rather belong to an inclusive whole. This idea matches the definition of the English word ‘and’ offered by the monolingual *Concise Oxford English Dictionary* (henceforth the COD), which is widely accepted as an authority on the English language:

“conj. 1 used to connect words of the same part of speech, clauses or sentences. connecting two identical comparatives, to emphasise a progressive change. connecting two identical words, implying great duration or great extent.”

The bilingual dictionary consulted for this work is the *Collins Spanish-English English-Spanish Dictionary* (henceforth the Collins) and it confirms the above correspondence between the Spanish ‘y’ and the English ‘and’, suggesting the following translation for ‘y’: “(copulative use) *and*”.

An example in English of what I mean by the conjunction ‘and’ as a *final-item connector* would be *For breakfast, John likes to have fruit, cereals, eggs and coffee*, where the breakfast consists of all four items.

3.2 The definitions of ‘o’ and ‘or’

The definition given by the DRAE for the Spanish term ‘o’ reads as follows (my translation):

“disjunctive conjunction which denotes difference, separation or alternativeness between two or more persons, things or ideas [...]. It also denotes the idea of equivalence, meaning *in other words, or put another way*.”

This definition suggests that the Spanish connector ‘o’ is appropriate for separating items on a list of exclusive options. This idea matches the definition of the English word ‘or’ offered by the COD:

“conj. 1 used to link alternatives. 2 introducing a synonym or explanation of a preceding word or phrase. 3 otherwise. 4 poetic/literary either.”

The Collins again confirms correspondence and suggests the following translation for ‘o’:
“(conjunction) *or*”.

An example in English of what I mean by the conjunction ‘or’ as a *final-item connector* would be *When Mary goes out, she likes to drink beer, wine, whisky or gin*, where Mary drinks only one of the four items.

Based on the definitions offered by the two monolingual dictionaries, it would appear that the suggestions given in the Collins are appropriate. However, in practice this is not so, as research into the matter has revealed.

4. Examples

Owing to the limited number of words in this work, the analysis focuses only on the examples where ‘y’ and ‘o’ have been translated contrary to the suggestions made in the Collins. Full lists of examples are included in Appendices 1 and 2.

4.1 Examples taken from texts sent by clients

The following examples have been taken from a variety of genres and from texts sent by various clients in order to ensure the examination of different types of texts written by more than one person so that results might not be influenced by any one personal style or source. For the same reasons, the samples taken from any one text were limited to a maximum of four and in most cases, that limit was kept to three.

Example 1 (taken from an audio guide for a Corot exhibition in Madrid):

ST	<i>Corot viaja por primera vez a Italia en 1825. En junio de 1826 iniciará un periplo en busca de lugares obligados para los paisajistas, como <u>Civita Castellana, Vitervo, Terni, o Piediluco.</u></i>
DT	Corot travelled to Italy for the first time in 1825. In June 1826, he began a search for places that were a must for landscape artists, such as <u>Civita Castellana, Vitervo, Terni or Piediluco.</u>
AT	...such as <u>Civita Castellana, Vitervo, Terni and Piediluco.</u>

Here, the ST list gives examples of places considered ideal for landscape artists to paint and which Corot discovered during his trip. The ST uses the connector ‘o’, which suggests that the four items are alternatives, i.e. at a purely grammatical level, it is suggesting that only one of those four examples is an ideal place to paint.

If the connector is translated as ‘or’, the same effect is achieved and the items are presented as alternatives from which only one option is valid. However, the four items on the list are all examples of ideal places for landscape artists and all of them are places visited by Corot. The use of the connector ‘and’ presents the items in this way and is more appropriate in the TL for the intended meaning of the ST.

Example 2 (taken from the same audio guide):

ST	<i>Así, sólo se desplazará hasta las cercanas poblaciones de <u>Tívoli, Genzano, o el lago Nemi.</u></i>
DT	Consequently, he travelled only to the nearby towns of <u>Tívoli, Genzano or Lake Nemi.</u>
AT	...the nearby towns of <u>Tívoli, Genzano and Lake Nemi.</u>

Here, the list contains locations visited by Corot during his time in Italy. The ST connects the final item with ‘o’, which, as in Example 1, presents the items as exclusive alternatives. This alternativeness is perhaps ‘overruled’ by the plural use of *cercanas poblaciones* (nearby towns), which suggests that all the towns were visited, not just one.

The use of ‘or’ in the TL is inappropriate as the plural *nearby towns* and overall meaning of the sentence clearly indicates that the three locations were all visited by Corot. Consequently, in this example, the Spanish ‘o’ has to be translated by the English ‘and’ to maintain the cohesion between the plural *nearby towns of* which leads readers to expect a list of the towns he visited, not a list of towns of which he visited only one. For the use of ‘or’ to be valid here, the sentence would have to be something like:

Consequently, we know he travelled to Tívoli, Genzano or Lake Nemi.

which maintains the cohesion between the first part of the sentence (*we know he travelled to*), which, in turn, prepares readers for a list of either alternatives or group-items.

Example 3 (taken from the same audio guide):

ST	<i>Así, <u>la narración, la acción o la anécdota</u> siempre fueron parejas a sus obras.</i>
DT	<u>Narrative, action or anecdote</u> were always present in his works.
AT	<u>Narrative, action and anecdote...</u>

This is an example of three features that formed part of Corot's work. His work included all three, not one or the other. This is backed by the fact that the verb (*fueron* – 'were') and the adjective describing the three features (*parejas* – in this context, translated as 'present') are in the plural, suggesting that all three were present in his work.

If we translate the 'o' with 'or' as suggested by the Collins, the features on the list become either-or options, which is not the intention of the ST. Possibly, the fact that the adjective in Spanish is in the plural overrules the alternativeness of the Spanish connector 'o' and leads readers to understand the 'wholeness' of the items on the list. This mechanism is not available in English as adjectives do not reflect plural or single qualities and the indication of the connector becomes more significant.

The translation with 'and' reflects the idea that all three features form part of Corot's work and is more appropriate for conveying the message realised in the ST.

Example 4 (taken from a university course – case study – on business):

ST	<i>Por razón de tipología de R/OM: <u>de producto, de gestión, tecnológico, social, comunicacional y de regulación.</u></i>
DT	By type of R/IP: <u>product, management, technology, social, communication and legislation.</u>
AT	By type of R/IP: <u>product, management, technology, social, communication or legislation.</u>

In this example, the ST gives the different criteria available for ordering lists of R/IPs (Risks/Improvement Possibilities). The full context suggests that the R/IPs could be listed together by either of the criteria on the list (*...los 750 R/OM detectados se pueden listar según diferentes criterios para facilitar su organización y gestión... – ...the 750 R/IPs can be grouped together by different criteria for easier organisation and processing...*), which would seem to suggest a list of alternatives. Even though there is an argument for all alternatives being available, the R/IPs are listed by any one criterion at a time; it is not possible to list them by all criteria at the same time.

The DT of the ST with ‘and’ suggests that the R/IPs can be listed by all criteria at the same time, which is not what the ST means and the choice is thus inappropriate. However, the translation of the Spanish ‘y’ by the English ‘or’ reflects the underlying meaning of the ST more accurately and is thus more appropriate.

Example 5 (taken from the same course – case study – on business):

ST	<i>Para ello se adjudicó un valor de priorización a cada uno de ellos (como resultado del producto del daño a la reputación por su probabilidad de ocurrencia), clasificándolos en <u>riesgos críticos, importantes, frecuentes y menores</u>.</i>
DT	To do this, a prioritisation value was given to each one (as a result of the product of the damage to reputation multiplied by the probability of it happening) and they were classified as <u>critical, important, frequent and minor risks</u> .
AT	...as <u>critical, important, frequent or minor risks</u> .

Here, the list in the ST gives the categories into which the risks were classified. It seems quite clear that a risk cannot be classified as a member of all four categories, e.g. it cannot be both critical and minor, yet the ST uses ‘y’ to connect the final item. On a grammatical level, this suggests the opposite of what would seem logical and perhaps the intended meaning is understood thanks to the reader’s previous intertextual experience or knowledge. As Hatim (2001: 114) says:

“The text receiver brings to the act of reading his or her own knowledge, belief and value systems – an activity which, if properly understood, is likely to shed some useful light on such issues as equivalence and translatability.”

The DT version in English with ‘and’ carries the inappropriate suggestion that a risk can indeed be classified as belonging to more than one, if not all four categories, and the more

appropriate translation of ‘y’ in this case is ‘or’ as it conveys the alternative, optional nature of the classification of the risks.

Example 6 (taken from a software manual):

ST	<i>Gracias a su sencillo interfaz, podrá gestionar todas las tareas que necesite para la gestión de <u>su servidor, clientes o dominios</u> con total sencillez, a través de formularios web intuitivos.</i>
DT	Thanks to its user-friendly interface, you can easily manage all the tasks <u>your server, clients or domains</u> require using its intuitive web forms.
AT	... <u>your server, clients and domains</u> ...

Here, the ST speaks of a list of items all of which are to be managed by the software in question. The interface helps users manage all the items on the list, not one or the other. Consequently, they are not options, as the use of ‘o’ might suggest, or at least, as its literal translation into English might suggest. A TT which offers ‘or’ as the translation of ‘o’ presents the items as alternatives and suggests that the interface lets users manage only one of the three options. However, the meaning is that users can manage all three through the interface and, consequently, the use of ‘and’ in the TT is more appropriate for the meaning of the ST.

Example 7 (taken from a press release issued by a leading Spanish business school):

ST	<u>El Ayuntamiento de Madrid, TYPESA, Urbaser, Telefónica Móviles, Unión Fenosa, Avenue TWC, Indra o Santander Central Hispano son algunas de las instituciones que lideran este Foro.</u>
DT	<u>The Madrid City Hall, TYPESA, Urbaser, Telefónica Móviles, Unión Fenosa, Avenue TWC, Indra or Santander Central Hispano are just a few of the institutions taking part in the forum.</u>
AT	<u>The Madrid City Hall, TYPESA, Urbaser, Telefónica Móviles, Unión Fenosa, Avenue TWC, Indra and Santander Central Hispano...</u>

Here, the ST presents a list of items which are all examples of the institutions taking part in a forum. At surface level, the use of ‘o’ would appear to present them as options, i.e. only one of said institutions is actually taking part; however, again the use of the plural (*son algunas* – are some) seems to ‘override’ the connector and indicate that the items form a whole despite the separating, alternative function (according to the DRAE definition) of the conjunction.

The DT using ‘or’ gives an awkward rendering as a result of the plural verb (are) and the overall meaning of the sentence; it is quite clear that all the items on the list form part of the forum and are not alternatives. Consequently, they need to be connected by a conjunction which indicates this fact. The use of ‘and’ in the TL assures the reader that all the institutions form part of the forum and is thus more appropriate; it also pluralizes the subject of the verb (are).

The full list of examples taken from texts sent by clients is attached as Appendix 1.

4.2 Examples taken from texts published by the EU

The following examples have been taken from the EU website (<http://europa.eu.int/>). This work assumes that the STs were written in English, as the official language of said institution, and so, unlike the examples examined in the previous section, here the SL is English and the TL is Spanish. The analyses of the Spanish translations are not meant to suggest in any case that the use of ‘o’ or ‘y’ is incorrect – it is, after all, not my first language – and the texts are analysed on the basis of the dictionary definitions given in sections 3.1 and 3.2 of this work. The intention here is to see whether or not Spanish translators also change the conjunctions when translating from English.

Owing to the institutional nature of the website from which the examples have been taken, they all belong to one genre (political/institutional texts).

Example 1 (taken from <http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/lvb/l28021.htm>):

ST	projects which prepare <u>new Community initiatives, instruments or legislation relating to the environment.</u>
DT	<i>proyectos que preparen <u>nuevas acciones, instrumentos o legislación comunitarios en materia de medio ambiente.</u></i>
AT	<i>...<u>nuevas acciones, instrumentos y legislación comunitarios en materia de medio ambiente.</u></i>

Here, the ST presents three items as options at which projects are aimed. The final item is connected by ‘or’, which suggests that they are exclusive, i.e. the projects prepare either one or the other. At surface level, the ‘or’ seems to be separating the three items on the list; however, on closer reading, it becomes apparent that the conjunction is separating the types of projects (projects which prepare new community initiatives, projects which prepare instruments or projects which prepare legislation...), i.e. not projects which are capable of preparing all three, albeit not at the same time.

The DT would apparently reflect this idea with the use of ‘o’, but in the AT, the translator has chosen ‘y’ which, from an English viewpoint at least, suggests that each of the projects referred to prepares all three options and would not appear to convey the underlying meaning of the ST.

Example 2 (taken from <http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/lvb/n26004.htm>):

ST	With the signing of <u>the European Economic Area (EEA) agreement</u> , the EU-Turkey <u>Customs Union and the Europe Agreements</u> , the internal market enjoyed by European enterprises can expand without waiting for enlargement.
DT	<i>Como consecuencia de la firma del <u>acuerdo sobre el Espacio Económico Europeo (EEE)</u>, de la <u>unión aduanera UE/Turquía y de los acuerdos europeos</u>, el mercado interior del que pueden beneficiarse las empresas europeas crecerá antes de la ampliación.</i>
AT	<i>...el <u>acuerdo sobre el Espacio Económico Europeo (EEE)</u>, de la <u>unión aduanera UE/Turquía o de los acuerdos europeos</u>...</i>

In this example, the expansion of the internal market depends on the signing of all three agreements and not just on any one of them. Consequently, the ST connects the final item with ‘and’.

The DT would lead to ‘y’ in Spanish and the meaning of the ST would appear to be conveyed appropriately; however, the translator chose to connect the final item with ‘o’. This would seem to indicate that the expansion of the internal market depends on only one of the agreements being signed and again this would not reflect the actual meaning of the ST.

Example 3 (taken from <http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/lvb/l32101.htm>):

ST	Electronic commerce is not limited to the Internet, but includes other applications such as <u>videotext, tele-shopping and catalogue sales on CD-Rom.</u>
DT	<i>El comercio electrónico no se limita a Internet, sino que incluye otras aplicaciones tales como <u>el videotexto, la telecompra, la compra por catálogo y por CD-ROM.</u></i>
AT	<i><u>...el videotexto, la telecompra, la compra por catálogo o por CD-ROM.</u></i>

Again, the ST presents a list of items connected finally by ‘and’, indicating that all the items on the list are included, i.e. they are all considered ‘other applications’.

The DT would seem to suggest the same in the TL, but the AT chooses ‘o’. According to the definition offered by the DRAE, this suggests exclusion, i.e. the example of the ‘*otras aplicaciones*’ is only one of the items on the list. As in other examples seen in section 4.1,

this exclusion is perhaps overruled by the plurality of *otras aplicaciones tales como* (other applications such as).

Example 4 (taken from <http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/cha/c11309.htm>):

ST	It is necessary to reform the early retirement system and, more generally, to ensure good implementation of the other systems of benefits, such as those covering <u>long-term unemployment, long-term sickness and invalidity</u> , which can be alternatives to withdrawal from the labour market, in order to make it pay to stay on the labour market.
DT	<i>Es necesario reformar los sistemas de jubilación anticipada y, más en general, garantizar una buena aplicación de los demás sistemas de prestaciones (como los de <u>desempleo de larga duración, enfermedad y discapacidad prolongada</u>, que pueden ofrecer vías alternativas al abandono del mercado de trabajo) a fin de lograr que resulte rentable permanecer en el mercado de trabajo.</i>
AT	<i><u>...desempleo de larga duración, enfermedad o discapacidad prolongada...</u></i>

Here, the ST again presents a list of examples and connects the final item with ‘and’, implying that they are all valid and applicable as examples of benefit systems. The DT, with ‘y’, would seem to reflect this idea appropriately, yet the AT again uses ‘o’. The dictionary idea of exclusion associated with this conjunction is again possibly overruled by the plurality of the concept of which the items on the list are examples (*sistemas de prestaciones* - benefit systems).

Example 5 (taken from <http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/lvb/l24016.htm>):

ST	<u>participation in, association to commit, attempts to commit and aiding, abetting, facilitating and counselling the commission of such actions.</u>
DT	<u>la participación en uno de los actos contemplados en los tres puntos anteriores, la asociación para cometer dicho acto, las tentativas de perpetrarlo, el hecho de colaborar, incitar y aconsejar a alguno a hacerlo y el hecho de facilitar la ejecución.</u>
AT	<u>la participación en uno de los actos contemplados en los tres puntos anteriores, la asociación para cometer dicho acto, las tentativas de perpetrarlo, el hecho de colaborar, incitar o aconsejar a alguno a hacerlo o el hecho de facilitar la ejecución.</u>

Here, the ST speaks of a list of intentional money-laundering activities, all of which are to be considered as such. Consequently, the conjunction used as a final-item connector is ‘and’.

The DT offers ‘y’ and, in accordance with the DRAE definition, the meaning of the ST would seem to be appropriately conveyed. However, the AT has opted for ‘o’, which, according to the definition from the same dictionary, presents the items on the list as exclusive alternatives – an idea not in line with the sense of the ST.

5. Percentages

5.1 Examples from texts sent by clients

A total of thirty examples were collected from various texts and clients. The number of examples of final-item connectors whose translation showed DT-AT correspondence

was twenty-three, and those whose AT differed from the DT numbered seven. This shows that in 21% of cases, the AT did not correspond to the DT.

5.2 Examples from the EU website

Of a total number of twenty-seven examples taken from texts chosen at random from the EU website, twenty-two showed DT-AT correspondence and five did not. This shows that the AT of approximately 19% of the occurrences of ‘y’ or ‘o’ did not correspond to the DT.

6. Patterns

The only pattern emerging from this work as a *possible* ‘rule’ (there is one example where this ‘rule’ does not hold for Spanish – see Appendix 1, page 33, “*Aromas de muy buena intensidad...*”) is where items are introduced in a list of examples by *such as - tales como/como*. In English, the final connector on such a list tends to be ‘and’, e.g. *such as videotext, tele-shopping and catalogue sales on CD-Rom* (Example 3, page 17) or *such as Civita Castellana, Vitervo, Terni and Piediluco* (Example 1, page 8). In Spanish, the equivalent final-item connector tends to be ‘o’, e.g. *tales como el videotexto, la telecompra, la compra por catálogo o por CD-Rom*, or *como Civita Castellana, Vitervo, Terni, o Piediluco*, suggesting one *possible* rule where the DT and AT should not correspond.

7. The Spanish point of view

To confirm whether or not the inverted use of ‘o’ and ‘y’ (‘inverted’ from the English point of view) was correct Spanish, examples were sent to native Spanish linguists asking for their opinions. The questions sent to those volunteering answers and explanations on the ASETRAD mailing list asked simply why one of the two conjunctions had been used

instead of the other in examples 1, 2, 3, 5, 6 and 7 of the texts analysed in section 4.1 of this work. Five linguists volunteered and their answers are summarised below.

It must be kept in mind that some of the linguists have a good level of English and work with said language, which could interfere with their ‘Spanish’ viewpoint on the use of ‘o’ and ‘y’.

Their full answers are provided in Appendix 3 and the examples to which their comments refer appear in section 4.1 of this work.

Example 1

All five of the answers suggested that the reason for using ‘o’ instead of ‘y’ was that the list was not exhaustive, but represented only some of the places that were ‘a must for landscape artists’.

Example 2

Three of the answers referred to the same idea as example 1, i.e. the list was not exhaustive and mentioned only some of the places visited by Corot. Interestingly, the other two suggested the possibility of ‘y’ being more correct as they understood the list to be complete.

Example 3

Three answers maintain the line followed in examples 1 and 2, i.e. the list is again not exhaustive. One answer suggests the conjunction is incorrect and that ‘y’ should be used as

the list is complete and another answer suggests that perhaps the three items are being used as synonyms.

Example 5

Three answers suggest that ‘y’ is used because the list specifies all four categories, i.e. the list is complete. One answer suggests that the correct conjunction would be ‘y’ as the risks can only belong to one of the four categories. One answer seems to separate the classifiable items from the categories to which they can belong and understands that ‘y’ is correct because the sentence is simply stating the four categories, not saying that risks can belong to them.

Example 6

One answer suggests the choice of ‘o’ depends on the subjunctive *necesite* (you need) and again suggests that ‘o’ has been used because the list is incomplete. One answer suggests that ‘o’ is used because the interface can manage all the items on the list, which would seem contrary to the complete/exhaustive idea of the answers given to the previous examples. Three answers imply that the interface can only manage or will decide which of the items he/she will manage at any given time, thus the use of ‘o’, and that possibly the user may only wish to manage one or two of the items, not necessarily all three.

Example 7

Again four answers refer to the fact that ‘o’ is used because the list is not exhaustive, which is a very common theme to many of the answers given. One answer, however, suggests that

the use of ‘o’ is incorrect, based on the understanding that all the institutions on the list lead the forum in question.

8. Conclusion

The work has shown that in around 20% of cases, the translation ES-EN and EN-ES of the conjunctions ‘o’, ‘y’, ‘and’ and ‘or’ do not follow the terms given as equivalents in the Collins. The reason for these significant percentages could be because the translators aimed to convey the actual meaning and intention of the ST. Although there is room to suggest that the ‘inverted’ translation of the conjunctions in both sets of examples may be due to poorly written STs or even to incorrect translation, the results of this work suggest that the uses of the conjunctions in both the STs and the TTs are correct.

The work has also opened up the possibility of at least one ‘rule’ for this apparently ‘inverted’ translation of the conjunctions (see section 6) and further investigation involving a much wider corpus of examples together with examination of explanations for the use of ‘and’ and ‘or’ from a greater number of native linguists of both languages would be required to confirm whether these indications are correct.

For other cases which do not fall under said *possible* rule, the explanations given by the linguists who volunteered explanations for the use of the conjunctions in Spanish seem to reveal an interesting concept of completeness/incompleteness of the actual list, where, in Spanish, if the items on the list are not exhaustive, the conjunction ‘o’ is preferred and if the list includes all possible items, i.e. it is complete, the conjunction ‘y’ is preferred. This

would also tie in with the aforementioned possible rule, where *tales como* or *como* (such as) introduces an incomplete list of examples and so ‘o’ is preferred.

Furthermore, this concept of completeness/incompleteness seems sufficient for the native Spanish linguists that took part in this work to say that the use of the Spanish conjunctions in ‘inverted’ translations is correct (although one linguist expressed doubts about the correctness of the use on two occasions, she also said in later correspondence that she may have been influenced by her knowledge of English) and may also explain the amount of repetition involved in this work (many of the example texts and explanations proffered by the Spanish linguists had this element of completeness/incompleteness in common). This possible confirmation of the correctness of the ‘inverted’ translation of the conjunctions would uphold Toury’s law of growing standardisation, where the TL pattern has been preferred over the SL pattern.

There are examples that suggest that one way of dealing with this *incompleteness* in English is by omitting a conjunction and adding ‘etc.’ to the end of the list (examples taken from <http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/es/lvb/l66000.htm>):

<p><i>las poblaciones de peces redondos demersales (peces que dependen de los fondos marinos, como por ejemplo, <u>el bacalao, el eglefino, el besugo, el mero o el salmonete</u>) son las que se encuentran hoy en mayor peligro</i></p>	<p>demersal roundfish stocks (fish dependent on sea beds, such as <u>cod, haddock, sea breams, groupers, red mullet, etc.</u>) are now the most endangered</p>
<p><i>los recursos bentónicos (especies que viven unidas a los fondos marinos o a sus sedimentos, como, por ejemplo, <u>el bogavante de Noruega, el lenguado o el rodaballo</u>) están sujetos en general a una sobreexplotación económica que no alcanza, sin embargo, los extremos catastróficos que se dan en los demersales</i></p>	<p>benthic resources (species attached to sea beds or living on sea bed sediments, such as <u>Norway lobster, sole, turbot, etc.</u>) show overall excessive economic exploitation, although this is less disastrous than for demersals</p>
<p><i>las poblaciones pelágicas (especies que apenas tienen contacto con los fondos marinos, como, por ejemplo, <u>el atún, la sardina, la caballa o el arenque</u>) se hallan menos afectadas gracias a las diversas medidas que se han adoptado para su reconstitución.</i></p>	<p>pelagic stocks (species with little contact with sea beds, such as <u>tuna, sardines, mackerel, herring, etc.</u>) are less affected as a result of the various measures taken to increase their numbers.</p>

However, further investigation again based on a corpus including a much higher number of examples would be required to confirm this concept of completeness/incompleteness and the corresponding preferences for ‘o’ or ‘y’ in Spanish and ‘or’, ‘and’ or ‘etc.’ in English.

Whatever the results further investigation may bring to light, the fact that 20% of the cases collected for this work do not comply with the terms suggested in bilingual dictionaries underlines the importance of translating texts on levels that go beyond the mere surface, an idea which needs to be applied not only to the more intricate aspects of texts such as the components of functional grammar, cohesion and intertextuality, but also to apparently ‘insignificant’ words such as what I have labelled *final-item connectors*. It becomes increasingly apparent that hidden meaning is everywhere in STs and translators must work with this in mind, translating on all text levels. As Neubert suggests (1984: 57):

“[Meaning is] the kingpin of translation studies. Without understanding what the text to be translated means [...] the translator would be hopelessly lost. This is why the translation scholar has to be a semanticist over and above everything else. By semanticist we mean a semanticist of the text, not just of words, structures and sentences. The key concept for the semantics of translation is textual meaning.”

The existence of DT-AT non-correspondence also highlights the fact that each text is a text in its own right: a TT is a “new act of communication [created] out of a previously existing one” (Hatim and Mason, 1990: 1). As such, surface-level renditions of the ST can often lead to awkward style, jarring, through lack of cohesion, for example, and even

grammatical imprecision through the incorrect translation of elements of text as apparently innocuous as conjunctions.

Each language and the native speakers of the language in question have their own interpretation of the world around them and this is reflected in the components of their language and how they use it:

“It is a basic tenet of linguistics that all languages can express everything that speakers wish to express, but it is equally true that all languages differ in terms of what is easy and what is difficult to express, what is essential and what is optional, what is expressed lexically and what grammatically.” (Coulthard, 1992: 18).

This may help explain why the definitions given in the monolingual dictionaries for the conjunctions examined in this work are similar, and it may also explain why the correspondence suggested in bilingual dictionaries does not hold true for all cases. This is one reason why translators should be wary of dependence on bilingual dictionaries. Their suggestions are often void of context and rarely go deeper than surface level; and blind, surface-level translation without resorting to analyses at other levels could lead to a poorly or even incorrectly written TT.

References

- Coulthard, M. (1992) 'Linguistic constraints on Translation'. *Studies in Translation/Estudos da Tradução, Ilha do Desterro* 28: 9-23. Florianópolis, Brazil: Editora da Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina.
- *Diccionario de la Lengua Española*, Vigésima Edición (1984). Madrid: Real Academia Española.
- Hatim, B. (2001) *Teaching and Researching Translation*. London: Longman.
- Hatim, B. and Mason, I. (1990) *Discourse and the Translator*. London: Longman.
- Neubert, A. (1984) (1997) 'Text-bound Translation Teaching'. In Wilss and Thome (eds) (1984) *Translation Theory and its Implementation in the Teaching of Translating and Interpreting*. Tübingen: Narr.
- *The Collins Spanish Dictionary*, Sixth Edition (2000). Glasgow: HarperCollins.
- *The Concise Oxford English Dictionary*, Tenth Edition, Revised (2002). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Toury, G. (1995) *Descriptive Translation Studies and Beyond*. Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins.

Appendix 1

Examples from texts sent by clients

Examples of correspondence between the DT and the AT

Source Text	Target Text
Tipología de la cata, identificación, localización, número de croquis y foto, naturaleza y cota de profundidad <u>o</u> plano de apoyo.	Type of the hollow/pit, identification, location, number of diagram and photo, nature and depth <u>or</u> support plan.
Esta nueva oportunidad tomará la forma de formación, reconversión, experiencia profesional, empleo <u>o</u> cualquier otra medida destinada a favorecer su inserción profesional.	This new opportunity will take the shape of training, reconversion, professional experience, employment <u>or</u> whatsoever other measure aimed at favouring their finding work.
Cada agente interesado, empresa <u>o</u> institución, deberá realizar la autoevaluación del nivel de cumplimiento de los requisitos normativos establecidos.	Each interested agent, company <u>or</u> institution must make a self-assessment of the level of fulfilment of the established standard requirements.
Método científico para la estimulación, mantenimiento y potenciación de la atención y la memoria en personas con disminución o pérdida de las mismas por estados de ansiedad, estrés <u>o</u> los asociados a la edad.	Scientific method for stimulation, maintenance and increasing attention and memory in persons suffering from loss or reduction of memory or attention span owing to anxiety, stress <u>or</u> age-related causes.

<p>Al son del mejor piano en directo, largas veladas de agradable conversación o una descansada pausa entre otros ambientes más animados.</p>	<p>To the sound of the best live piano music, long evenings with interesting conversations or a rest from other, less quiet atmospheres.</p>
<p>Toda la música, toda la diversión y toda la fiesta.</p>	<p>All the music, all the fun and all the fiesta.</p>
<p>De ahí que en esta nueva monografía se presenten, como en las anteriores —<i>Objeto, Cuerpo y Habitación</i>— lecturas muy variadas del espectro significante Casa.</p>	<p>Consequently, and as in earlier monographs – <i>Object, Body and Room</i> – this new edition contains a wide variety of articles from the spectrum of meaning of the <i>house</i>.</p>
<p>En este sentido las visiones objetuales son pobres, distantes y limitativas.</p>	<p>Accordingly, objectual visions are poor, distant and limiting.</p>
<p>Su actividad se centra en la promoción de obra nueva, rehabilitación de inmuebles, desarrollo de suelo y gestión urbanística, orientando su actividad hacia los segmentos residencial, industrial y terciario.</p>	<p>The company focuses on new developments, building refurbishment, ground space development and town planning. It works mainly for the residential, industrial and tertiary segments</p>
<p>Los productos de fergrap están elaborados con el aluminio de la mas alta calidad y tenemos un control de calidad que testea cada una de nuestras partidas para garantizar que la dureza y las características de nuestros clips sean siempre las mismas</p>	<p>Fergrap's products are made with the highest quality aluminium and our quality assurance system tests each and every batch to guarantee that the hardness and specifications of our clips remain constant to give our clients maximum safety,</p>

<p>dando así la máxima seguridad, fiabilidad y garantía a nuestros clientes.</p>	<p>reliability and guarantee</p>
<p>en una sociedad en la que “joven” es lo contrario de “enemigo” y “nuevo” lo contrario de “culpable” y en la que, en consecuencia, lo viejo, lo usado, lo vivido, lo lento, lo carnoso, contagian la enfermiza viscosidad de una amenaza alienígena; en una sociedad de cosas hechizadas que se intercambian solas y casas encantadas que se construyen a sí mismas; en una sociedad en la que el arte se limita a escenificar hasta el agotamiento la rentabilidad de su propia muerte; en la que el Supermercado, el Parque Temático y la Instalación se solapan sin diferencia; en la que la individualización de la expresión ya sólo permite comunicar la sucesión de los autismos (con la consiguiente desaparición de corrientes, movimientos o estilos de los que un crítico pueda derivar una tradición); en una sociedad así, la ruina -física o arquitectónica- es la comparecencia</p>	<p>In a society that is to no longer have a past, where scrap is removed from the horizon by the very swiftness of destruction and the renewal of goods overcomes humanity as if it were an obstacle or a parasite, in a society in which ‘young’ is the opposite to ‘enemy’ and ‘new’ is the opposite to ‘guilty’ and in which, consequently, old things, used things, experience, slowness and fleshiness spread the diseased viscosity of an alien threat, in a society of enchanted things that are exchanged under their own steam and haunted houses that build themselves, in a society in which art is limited to representing the profitability of its own demise to the point of exhaustion, in which the Supermarket, the Theme Park and the Installation overlap as one and the same, in which the individualisation of expression now allows only the communication of the successors of autism (with the consequent</p>

<p>repentina <i>de su fracaso</i>: demasiada lentitud, demasiada “comunidad”, demasiado espacio entre los escombros.</p>	<p>disappearance of trends, movements or styles from which a critic can extract a tradition), in a society such as this, the ruin, whether physical or architectural, is the sudden appearance of <i>its failure</i>. Too much slowness, too much ‘community’, too much space among the debris.</p>
<p>Recuperamos los materiales de construcción, reprimidos, ocultos y olvidados en el cuerpo del edificio.</p>	<p>It brings back the building materials that were repressed, hidden and forgotten in the body of the building itself.</p>
<p>Sus consecuencias políticas, judiciales y personales, especialmente en lo tocante a la represión del Régimen del General Franco contra los vencidos en la Guerra, son parte esencial de nuestra historia.</p>	<p>Its political, legal and personal consequences, especially with regard to the repression employed by General Franco’s regime against the vanquished in the war, form an essential part of our history.</p>
<p>El Archivo General de la Guerra Civil Española ha sido creado por Real Decreto 426/1999, de 12 de marzo (BOE de 13 de marzo de 1999), tomando como núcleo documental el existente en la Sección Guerra Civil del Archivo Histórico Nacional, con la finalidad de reunir, conservar y disponer sus fondos</p>	<p>The General Archive on the Spanish Civil War was created by Royal Decree 426/1999, of 12 March, (Official State Gazette of 13 March 1999), based on the documents in the Civil War Section of the National History Archive, in order to bring together, conserve and make available the documentary collection for the purposes of</p>

documentales para la investigación, la cultura y la información.	research, culture and information.
La Sección Político Social, de mucho mayor volumen, conserva documentación recogida en todo tipo de instituciones u organizaciones republicanas, estructurándose básicamente por la zona de procedencia: Alicante, Aragón, Barcelona, Bilbao, Cádiz, Cartagena, Castellón, Extremadura, Gijón, Jaén, Lérida, Madrid, Santander, Valencia, Valladolid y Vinaroz.	The Social-Political Section, which is much larger and conserves documents collected from all kinds of Republican organisations and institutions, is basically structured in accordance with the area of origin: Alicante, Aragón, Barcelona, Bilbao, Cádiz, Cartagena, Castellón, Extremadura, Gijón, Jaén, Lérida, Madrid, Santander, Valencia, Valladolid and Vinaroz.
Vino joven color amarillo pajizo brillante. De nariz buena y fresca, con tonos a mango, maracuyá y hierbabuena.	<i>Joven</i> wine, brilliant straw yellow. Good and fresh on the nose, with notes of mango, passion fruit and mint.
Aromas de muy buena intensidad, notas de frutas frescas exóticas como la piña, el maracuyá y la paraguaya.	Intense aromas, notes of fresh exotic fruit such as pineapple, passion fruit and paraguaya peach.
La Plaza Mayor de Salamanca ha sido escenario de incontables actos públicos entre los que se podrían destacar las corridas de toros, los mercados, ajusticiamientos en la antigüedad y conciertos musicales, terrazas de verano,	The Plaza Mayor of Salamanca has been the stage for endless public events, including bullfights, markets, public trials in Ancient times, and today, musical concerts, summer terraces, public speaking and a place to enjoy a stroll with fellow citizens.

pregones <u>y</u> lugar de paseo y convivencia en la actualidad	
ASOMATE A VALLADOLID se reserva el derecho de modificar unilateralmente, en cualquier momento y sin ningún aviso previo, la presentación y la configuración del Portal, así como también el modificar, ampliar <u>o</u> eliminar algunos servicios y utilidades.	ASOMATE A VALLADOLID reserves the right to unilaterally modify, at any time and without notice, the presentation and configuration of the portal, or modify, extend or remove the services and utilities offered.
También el edificio de administración comercial, exposición <u>y</u> oficina técnica forma parte de este complejo.	The commercial administration, exhibition and technical office building is also a part of this complex.

Examples of non-correspondence between the DT and the AT

Source Text	Target Text
<i>Corot viaja por primera vez a Italia en 1825. En junio de 1826 iniciará un periplo en busca de lugares obligados para los paisajistas, como Civita Castellana, Vitervo, Terni, <u>o</u> Piediluco.</i>	Corot travelled to Italy for the first time in 1825. In June 1826, he began a search for places that were a must for landscape artists, such as Civita Castellana, Vitervo, Terni and Piediluco.
<i>Así, sólo se desplazará hasta las cercanas</i>	Consequently, he travelled only to the

<i>poblaciones de Tivoli, Genzano, <u>o</u> el lago Nemi.</i>	nearby towns of Tivoli, Genzano and Lake Nemi.
<i>Así, la narración, la acción <u>o</u> la anécdota siempre fueron parejas a sus obras.</i>	Narrative, action and anecdote were always present in his works.
<i>Por razón de tipología de R/OM: de producto, de gestión, tecnológico, social, comunicacional <u>y</u> de regulación.</i>	By type of R/IP: product, management, technology, social, communication or legislation.
<i>Para ello se adjudicó un valor de priorización a cada uno de ellos (como resultado del producto del daño a la reputación por su probabilidad de ocurrencia), clasificándolos en riesgos críticos, importantes, frecuentes <u>y</u> menores.</i>	To do this, a prioritisation value was given to each one (as a result of the product of the damage to reputation multiplied by the probability of it happening) and they were classified as critical, important, frequent or minor risks.
<i>Gracias a su sencillo interfaz, podrá gestionar todas las tareas que necesite para la gestión de su servidor, clientes <u>o</u> dominios con total sencillez, a través de formularios web intuitivos.</i>	Thanks to its user-friendly interface, you can easily manage all the tasks your server, clients and domains require using its intuitive web forms.
<i>El Ayuntamiento de Madrid, TYPSA, Urbaser, Telefónica Móviles, Unión Fenosa, Avenue TWC, Indra <u>o</u> Santander Central Hispano son algunas de las instituciones que lideran este Foro.</i>	The Madrid City Hall, TYPSA, Urbaser, Telefónica Móviles, Unión Fenosa, Avenue TWC, Indra and Santander Central Hispano are just a few of the institutions taking part in the forum.

Appendix 2

Examples from the EU website

Examples of correspondence between the DT and the AT

Source Text	Target Text
The products concerned are olive oil, olives that are fresh, chilled, dried or prepared, and olive residues.	<i>Los productos a los que se aplica esta OCM son el aceite de oliva, las aceitunas frescas, refrigeradas, secas o preparadas, los residuos y los orujos.</i>
Olive oil and other oils obtained from olive oil may be the subject of marketing standards. These standards apply in particular to quality grading, packaging and presentation.	<i>El aceite de oliva y los demás aceites obtenidos a partir de aceite de oliva pueden estar sujetos a normas de comercialización. Dichas normas se refieren a las categorías de calidad, el envasado y la presentación, entre otras cosas.</i>
Professional or operators' organisations may draw up work programmes for the purpose of improving the market for olive oil and olives, in the fields of product quality, environment, information and administrative management.	<i>Las organizaciones profesionales y las organizaciones de agentes económicos pueden elaborar programas de trabajo para mejorar el mercado del aceite de oliva y las aceitunas tanto en lo que se refiere a la calidad como al medio ambiente, la información y la gestión administrativa.</i>
As with other direct aids, certain obligations must be respected: cross-	<i>Al igual que en las demás ayudas directas, deben respetarse ciertas obligaciones como</i>

<p>compliance, modulation and financial discipline.</p>	<p><i>la ecocondicionalidad, la modulación y la disciplina financiera.</i></p>
<p>ensure that competition policy takes account of the needs of entrepreneurs, SMEs, innovation, competitiveness and access to markets.</p>	<p><i>integrar en la política de competencia las necesidades de los empresarios, la dimensión «PYME», la innovación, la competitividad y el acceso a los mercados.</i></p>
<p>the use of non-renewable sources may mean that these resources will not be available for future generations and extractive operations harm the environment (air, soil and water pollution, noise, destruction or disturbance of natural habitats, visual impact on the surrounding landscape, effects on groundwater levels).</p>	<p><i>la explotación de recursos no renovables puede suponer su agotamiento para las generaciones futuras y la explotación minera puede dañar la calidad del medio ambiente (contaminación del aire, el suelo, el agua, ruido, destrucción o perturbación de hábitats naturales, impacto visual en el paisaje, diversas repercusiones en los niveles freáticos, etc.).</i></p>
<p>Resource use, discharges to air and water and land use are proposed as indicators.</p>	<p><i>Entre los indicadores que podrían resultar pertinentes se incluyen la utilización de recursos, las emisiones atmosféricas, los vertidos al agua y la utilización del suelo.</i></p>
<p>The Commission is willing to facilitate a framework to intensify the dialogue between the Member States, both sides of industry, NGOs, the Commission and other</p>	<p><i>La Comisión manifiesta estar dispuesta a favorecer la creación de un marco especial para el diálogo que agrupe a los Estados miembros, los interlocutores sociales de la</i></p>

stakeholders.	<i>industria, las ONG, la Comisión y demás partes interesadas.</i>
It invites all these parties to make proposals on the objectives, constitution and format of such a framework.	<i>Invita a todos estos agentes a formular propuestas sobre los objetivos, composición y estructura de ese marco.</i>
the acquisition, possession or use of property, knowing, at the time of receipt, that such property was derived from criminal activity or from an active participation in such activity.	<i>la adquisición, la posesión o la utilización de bienes por quien sabe, en el momento de la recepción de estos bienes, que proceden de una actividad delictiva o de la participación en tal actividad.</i>
to make every effort to ensure that the European industry develops in time all the technology, components and equipment required for the launching of HDTV services.	<i>poner todos los medios para que la industria europea desarrolle a su debido tiempo toda la tecnología, los componentes y equipos necesarios para la puesta en marcha de los servicios de TVAD.</i>
to make every effort to ensure that the European film and television production industry achieves the capability, experience and dimension required to occupy a competitive position on the world market.	<i>poner todos los medios para que la industria europea del cine y de la televisión adquiera la capacidad, la experiencia y las dimensiones necesarias para resultar competitiva en el mercado mundial.</i>
Socrates is a funding programme under which any pupil, student or teacher may obtain a grant, though applications for	<i>SÓCRATES es un programa de financiación en el marco del cual cada alumno, estudiante o profesor puede recibir una</i>

<p>project funding cannot be submitted in an individual capacity.</p>	<p><i>beca, a pesar de que no sea posible presentar solicitudes de financiación de un proyecto a título individual.</i></p>
<p>More specifically, the green paper deals with the conservation of fishery resources, environmental considerations, fleet management, governance, monitoring and control, economic and social issues, aquaculture, international implications and, finally, Mediterranean policy.</p>	<p><i>El Libro Verde aborda, en concreto, los ámbitos siguientes: la conservación de los recursos pesqueros, la dimensión medioambiental, la gestión de la flota, la gobernanza, la vigilancia y el control, la dimensión económica y social, la acuicultura, la dimensión internacional y, en fin, el caso especial del Mediterráneo.</i></p>
<p>managing of TACs and quotas on a multiannual basis, managing groups of stocks containing several species, and ecosystem management (i.e. relating to the sea's ecosystem and applicable to all aspects of fisheries management, from resources to consumers)</p>	<p><i>el establecimiento de una gestión plurianual (aplicable a los TAC y las cuotas), pluriespecífica (comprehensiva de los grupos de poblaciones que engloban varias especies) y ecosistémica (es decir, dirigida al conjunto del ecosistema marino y aplicable a todos los ámbitos de la gestión pesquera, desde los recursos hasta los consumidores)</i></p>
<p>developing a system based on social, economic and environmental indicators, making it possible to measure the progress</p>	<p><i>la creación de un sistema que permita medir con indicadores sociales, económicos y ambientales los avances realizados</i></p>

<p>of the CFP, especially as regards sustainable development.</p>	<p><i>gracias a la PPC, especialmente en materia de desarrollo sostenible.</i></p>
<p>The information provided to consumers should not be restricted to the biological, chemical and physical composition of the food they eat.</p>	<p><i>La información de los consumidores debería extenderse más allá de la composición biológica, química y física de los nutrientes, y debería también abarcar el valor nutritivo de los alimentos.</i></p>
<p>The Commission will submit proposals laying down criteria governing dietetic foods, food supplements and fortified foods.</p>	<p><i>La Comisión presentará propuestas destinadas a establecer criterios para los alimentos dietéticos, los suplementos alimenticios y los alimentos enriquecidos.</i></p>
<p>For the first time, the EU relied on streamlined key policy coordination instruments -- the broad economic policy guidelines (BEPGs), the employment guidelines, and the internal market strategy -- which it gives a new three-year perspective.</p>	<p><i>Por primera vez, la UE ha utilizado instrumentos racionalizados de coordinación de las políticas esenciales -- las Orientaciones generales de política económica (OGPE), las Directrices para el empleo y la Estrategia para el mercado interior--, dándoles una perspectiva trienal.</i></p>
<p>This objective encompasses a wide range of areas, in particular intrinsic quality at work, skills, lifelong learning and career development, gender equality, health and safety at work, flexibility and security,</p>	<p><i>Este objetivo abarca numerosos ámbitos, en particular la calidad intrínseca del trabajo, las competencias, el aprendizaje permanente, el desarrollo de la carrera profesional, la igualdad entre hombres y</i></p>

<p>inclusion and access to the labour market, work organisation and work-life balance, social dialogue and worker involvement, diversity and non-discrimination, and overall work performance</p>	<p><i>mujeres, la salud y la seguridad en el trabajo, la flexibilidad y la seguridad, la inserción y el acceso al mercado laboral, la organización del trabajo y el equilibrio entre la vida profesional y la vida privada, el diálogo social y la participación de los trabajadores, la diversidad y la no discriminación, y el rendimiento general del trabajo</i></p>
<p>abolishing, in collective agreements, local, regional or national restrictions relating to qualifications</p>	<p><i>suprimir las restricciones locales, regionales o nacionales en materia de cualificaciones en los convenios colectivos</i></p>
<p>It is necessary to reform the early retirement system and, more generally, to ensure good implementation of the other systems of benefits, such as those covering long-term unemployment, long-term sickness and invalidity, which can be alternatives to withdrawal from the labour market, in order to make it pay to stay on the labour market</p>	<p><i>Es necesario reformar los sistemas de jubilación anticipada y, más en general, garantizar una buena aplicación de los demás sistemas de prestaciones (como los de desempleo de larga duración, enfermedad o discapacidad prolongada, que pueden ofrecer vías alternativas al abandono del mercado de trabajo) a fin de lograr que resulte rentable permanecer en el mercado de trabajo</i></p>

Examples of non-correspondence between the DT and the AT

Source Text	Target Text
<p>projects which prepare new Community initiatives, instruments or legislation relating to the environment.</p>	<p><i>proyectos que preparen nuevas acciones, instrumentos y legislación comunitarios en materia de medio ambiente.</i></p>
<p>With the signing of the European Economic Area (EEA) agreement, the EU-Turkey Customs Union and the Europe Agreements, the internal market enjoyed by European enterprises can expand without waiting for enlargement.</p>	<p><i>Como consecuencia de la firma del acuerdo sobre el Espacio Económico Europeo (EEE), de la unión aduanera UE/Turquía y de los acuerdos europeos, el mercado interior del que pueden beneficiarse las empresas europeas crecerá antes de la ampliación.</i></p>
<p>Electronic commerce is not limited to the Internet, but includes other applications such as videotext, tele-shopping and catalogue sales on CD-Rom.</p>	<p><i>El comercio electrónico no se limita a Internet, sino que incluye otras aplicaciones tales como el videotexto, la telecompra, la compra por catálogo y por CD-ROM.</i></p>
<p>participation in, association to commit, attempts to commit and aiding, abetting, facilitating and counselling the commission of such actions.</p>	<p><i>la participación en uno de los actos contemplados en los tres puntos anteriores, la asociación para cometer dicho acto, las tentativas de perpetrarlo, el hecho de colaborar, incitar y aconsejar a alguno a hacerlo o el hecho de facilitar la ejecución.</i></p>

<p>It is necessary to reform the early retirement system and, more generally, to ensure good implementation of the other systems of benefits, such as those covering long-term unemployment, long-term sickness and invalidity, which can be alternatives to withdrawal from the labour market, in order to make it pay to stay on the labour market.</p>	<p><i>Es necesario reformar los sistemas de jubilación anticipada y, más en general, garantizar una buena aplicación de los demás sistemas de prestaciones (como los de desempleo de larga duración, enfermedad o discapacidad prolongada, que pueden ofrecer vías alternativas al abandono del mercado de trabajo) a fin de lograr que resulte rentable permanecer en el mercado de trabajo.</i></p>
--	---

Appendix 3

E-mail to the ASETRAD mailing list and the replies

Original e-mail and translation

The following e-mail was sent to the list (my translation):

<p>Hola a todos/as:</p> <p>Estoy buscando ayuda para un trabajo de investigación que tengo que presentar para un Master en Traducción.</p> <p>Busco voluntarios/as (nativos/as de países de habla hispana) para contestar preguntas sobre el uso de las conjunciones ‘y’ y ‘o’ en ejemplos de textos (todo en español).</p> <p>Si tienes tiempo para echar una mano y contestar las preguntas, contacta conmigo por correo y te mando la encuesta.</p> <p>Gracias anticipadas.</p>	<p>Dear all,</p> <p>I’m looking for help with a research project for an MA in Translation Studies.</p> <p>I’m looking for volunteers (native Spanish-speakers) to answer questions on the use of the conjunctions ‘y’ and ‘o’ in a few sample texts (all in Spanish).</p> <p>If you have time to lend a hand and answer the questions, please mail me and I’ll send you a copy.</p> <p>Thanks in advance.</p>
--	---

Questions sent with e-mail and translation

The document with the questions sent was as follows. The different answers are included in the corresponding places (my translation follows):

Muchas gracias por colaborar.

Por favor, lee los siguientes extractos de textos reales y contesta según tu opinión la pregunta que sigue cada texto. Si quieres citar algún libro, poner ejemplos para apoyar tu contestación, etc., puedes hacerlo. No hay límite de palabras a tus contestaciones.

Cuando hayas terminado, por favor guarda el fichero añadiendo _TUNOMBRE al fichero original y devuélvemelo por correo electrónico.

Si tienes cualquier pregunta, no dudes en enviarme un correo.

Otra vez, ¡gracias!

Texto 1 (de un audioguía para una exposición del artista francés Corot):

Corot viaja por primera vez a Italia en 1825. En junio de 1826 iniciará un periplo en busca de lugares obligados para los paisajistas, como Civita Castellana, Vitervo, Terni, o Piediluco.

¿Por qué la conjunción ‘o’ delante de ‘Piediluco’ es ‘o’ y no ‘y’?

Respuestas:

A. El autor parece indicar que todos son “lugares obligados”, pero que Corot sólo visitó uno o algunos, pero no todos; incluso puede que no visitara ninguno de estos, sino otros similares.

Si hubiese puesto “y”, se entendería que visitó todos los lugares que el autor menciona.

B. Porque son ejemplos ilustrativos, no una lista exhaustiva de todos los «lugares obligados para los paisajistas». Entiendo además que Corot visitó más lugares que no se mencionan.

C. Se ha utilizado la conjunción “o” porque se están citando *solamente* algunos de los lugares *obligados* para los paisajistas. En efecto, no se podría dar por concluida la lista dado que el punto de vista en cuanto a la elección de esos “lugares obligados” es subjetivo.

La conjunción “y” hubiese presupuesto que se habían citado todos esos lugares.

D. Los lugares citados no son todos los que visitó, sino sólo algunos: la enumeración no es completa, se citan algunos ejemplos y ya está.

E. Porque no sólo visitó esos cuatro lugares que se citan; estos son sólo algunos ejemplos. Sin embargo, en este caso no es necesario el uso de la conjunción “o”, porque el autor ya dice “como”, lo que indica que se van a citar varios ejemplos. Este uso aparece recogido en el Diccionario de dudas y dificultades de la lengua española de Manuel Seco (p. 316).

Texto 2 (de la misma audioguía):

Así, sólo se desplazará hasta las cercanas poblaciones de Tívoli, Genzano, o el lago Nemi.

¿Por qué la conjunción ‘o’ delante de ‘el lago Nemi’ es ‘o’ y no ‘y’?

Respuestas:

A. No lo sé, me parece poco claro. Tendría que decir a qué localidades se desplazó y utilizar “y”. El “o” indica que el autor ignora a cuáles fue.

B. Puede que «sólo» signifique que solamente realizó trayectos cortos. En este caso, los lugares mencionados en el texto 2 serían ejemplos ilustrativos. Si la frase tiene el sentido de que visitó exclusivamente Tívoli, Genzano y el lago Nemi, ningún otro lugar, yo hubiera utilizado la conjunción «y», no «o».

C. Pienso que el uso de la conjunción “o” es incorrecto. Por los motivos mencionados anteriormente, creo que hubiese sido necesario emplear “y”.

D. Es el mismo caso del texto anterior. En este texto no se mencionan todas las poblaciones a las que se desplazó; sino sólo tres, como ejemplo.

E. Cfr. respuesta al texto 1.

Texto 3 (de la misma audioguía):

Así, la narración, la acción o la anécdota siempre fueron parejas a sus obras.

¿Por qué la conjunción ‘o’ delante de ‘la anécdota’ es ‘o’ y no ‘y’?

Respuestas:

A. No está muy claro. Tal vez el autor considere que los tres elementos son sinónimos.

B. Podrían mencionarse muchas otras características, pero se han escogido tres: la narración, la acción y la anécdota.

C. Misma respuesta que para el texto número dos.

D. Caben dos posibilidades (una excluye a la otra): No se citan todos los elementos morfológicos de las obras, sino sólo algunos (para dar ejemplos); se citan todos los elementos morfológicos de las obras, pero no se daban a la vez en una sola obra.

E. Cfr. respuesta al texto 1.

Texto 4 (de un curso universitario (caso)):

Para ello se adjudicó un valor de priorización a cada uno de ellos (como resultado del producto del daño a la reputación por su probabilidad de ocurrencia), clasificándolos en riesgos críticos, importantes, frecuentes y menores.

¿Por qué la conjunción ‘y’ delante de ‘menores’ es ‘y’ y no ‘o’?

Respuestas:

A. Yo hubiese puesto “o”, porque los riesgos o son críticos, o son importantes, o son frecuentes o son menores.

Lo comenté en un curso de corrección y me dijeron que también se podía usar “y”, pero yo no estoy de acuerdo.

B. Es una clasificación en la que los objetos de estudio se agrupan en cuatro categorías. Todas ellas se especifican. Es una enumeración de categorías finitas.

C. La conjunción “o” implica que se ofrece la posibilidad de elegir uno o varios de entre varios elementos mientras que, en el ejemplo que nos ocupa, los elementos han sido clasificados en cuatro tipos, ni más ni menos. Se trata de una constatación, no de una presentación de algunos elementos omitiéndose otros.

D. Aquí la enumeración sí es completa, no existen más riesgos sino que éstos son todos los que hay.

E. Porque se citan cuatro categorías totalmente diferenciadas.

Texto 5 (de un manual de usuario de software):

Gracias a su sencillo interfaz, podrá gestionar todas las tareas que necesite para la gestión de su servidor, clientes o dominios con total sencillez, a través de formularios Web intuitivos.

¿Por qué la conjunción ‘o’ delante de ‘dominios’ es ‘o’ y no ‘y’?

Respuestas:

A. Entiendo que porque son gestiones independientes y el interfaz permite gestionarlas a todas; yendo un poco más allá (sin entender demasiado del tema), puedo pensar que porque no es probable que el mismo cliente haga los tres tipos de gestiones.

B. El subjuntivo «necesite» invita a utilizar la conjunción «o». Se han dividido las gestiones en tres categorías, *grosso modo*, pero seguro que podría detallarse más. Se podrían enumerar otras tareas que el programa puede realizar.

C. El usuario decidirá lo que quiere gestionar con ese interfaz, es decir, que puede elegir, de ahí el correcto uso de la conjunción “o”.

D. Hay dos razones: la gestión de servidor, la gestión de clientes y la gestión de dominios se han considerado posibilidades independientes porque no pueden realizarse a la vez (o gestionas el servidor, o gestionas los clientes, o gestionas los dominios); tampoco el usuario tiene por qué realizar la gestión del servidor, los clientes y los dominios, sino que podría necesitar realizar sólo una o dos de las mencionadas gestiones.

E. Supongo que para especificar que la gestión puede aplicarse sólo a uno de los tres elementos (servidor, clientes o dominios), y no a los tres simultáneamente, ni a dos de ellos.

Texto 6 (de una nota de prensa de una escuela de negocios):

El Ayuntamiento de Madrid, TYPESA, Urbaser, Telefónica Móviles, Unión Fenosa, Avenue TWC, Indra o Santander Central Hispano son algunas de las instituciones que lideran este Foro.

¿Por qué la conjunción ‘o’ delante de ‘Santander Central Hispano’ es ‘o’ y no ‘y’?

Respuestas:

A. Para mí es incorrecto. Si todas esas instituciones lideran el Foro, habría que poner “y”.

B. Son ejemplos de «algunas» de las instituciones que lideran el foro. No se trata de enumerarlas todas.

C. Porque se citan solamente *algunas* de las instituciones que lideran el foro.

D. No se mencionan todas las instituciones que lideran el Foro; sino sólo algunas de ellas (probablemente, las de mayor relevancia).

E. Una vez más, para indicar que éstas no son todas las instituciones que participan en el citado foro. De todos modos, yo habría puesto un “y” en lugar del “o”, porque después ya se dice que “son algunas de las instituciones que lideran este Foro”, y creo que se cae en

una redundancia.

Thanks for your help.

Please read the following extracts from real texts and answer the question that follows each text as you think fit. If you wish to quote from a source, give examples to support your answer, etc., please do so. There is no limit to the number of words you can write.

When you've finished, please save the file adding _YOURNAME to the name of the original file and send it to me by e-mail.

If anything's not clear, please get in touch.

Once again, thank you!

Text 1 (from an audio guide for an exhibition of the work of the French artist Corot):

Corot viaja por primera vez a Italia en 1825. En junio de 1826 iniciará un periplo en busca de lugares obligados para los paisajistas, como Civita Castellana, Vitervo, Terni, o Piediluco.

¿Why is the conjunction before 'Piediluco' 'o' and not 'y'?

Answers:

A. The author appears to be saying that they are all 'must-see places' but that Corot only visited one or two of them, not all of them; he might not have visited any of them but rather others similar to these places.

If he had put 'y', it would mean that he visited all the places the author mentions.

B. Because they are illustrative examples, not a complete list of all the 'places the must be seen by landscape artists'. I also understand that Corot visited more places that are not mentioned.

C. The conjunction 'o' has been used because only some of the places landscape artists must visit are being mentioned. Indeed, the list cannot be taken as finished given that the point of view regarding the choice of the places is subjective.

The conjunction 'y' would have meant that all the places were being mentioned.

D. The places mentioned are not all the places he visited, but rather just some; the list is not complete, a few examples are given, that's all.

E. Because he didn't visit only the four places mentioned; they are just a few examples.

However, in this case, the use of the conjunction ‘o’ is not necessary because the author uses ‘como’, which indicates that the list is to contain examples. This use is included in the *Dictionary of Doubts and Difficulties of the Spanish Language* by Manuel Seco (p. 316)¹.

Text 2 (from the same audio guide):

Así, sólo se desplazará hasta las cercanas poblaciones de Tívoli, Genzano, o el lago Nemi.

¿Why is the conjunction before ‘el lago Nemi’ ‘o’ and not ‘y’?

Answers:

A. I don’t know, it’s not very clear. It should say the places he went to and use ‘y’. The ‘o’ shows that the author doesn’t know which places he visited.

B. maybe it ‘only’ means that he made short trips. In this case, the places mentioned in text 2 would be illustrative examples. if the sentence meant the he only visited Tívoli, Genzano and Lake Nemi, nowhere else, I would have used the conjunction ‘y’ and not ‘o’.

C. I think that the use of the conjunction ‘o’ is incorrect. For the reasons I gave for text 1 I think the conjunction ‘y’ should have been used.

D. This is the same case as the previous text. In this text, not all the towns and villages he visited are mentioned, only three by way of example.

E. Please see my answer to text 1.

Text 3 (from the same audio guide):

Así, la narración, la acción o la anécdota siempre fueron parejas a sus obras.

¿Why is the conjunction before ‘la anécdota’ ‘o’ and not ‘y’?

Answers:

A. It’s not very clear. Perhaps the author thinks the three items are synonyms.

B. Many other characteristics could be mentioned, but only three have been chosen: narrative, action and anecdote.

C. Same answer as for text 2.

¹ *Diccionario de dudas y dificultades de la lengua española.*

D. There are two possibilities (one excludes the other): not all the morphological elements of the works are mentioned, only some of them (by way of example); all the morphological elements of the works are mentioned but they didn't appear in any one work at the same time.

E. Please see my answer to text 1.

Text 4 (from a university course – a case study):

Para ello se adjudicó un valor de priorización a cada uno de ellos (como resultado del producto del daño a la reputación por su probabilidad de ocurrencia), clasificándolos en riesgos críticos, importantes, frecuentes y menores.

¿Why is the conjunction before 'menores' 'y' and not 'o'?

Answers:

A. I would have put 'o' because the risks are either critical, important, frequent or minor. I commented this example on a proofreading course and I was told that 'y' was also possible, but I don't agree.

B. This is a list in which the objects under study are classified into four categories. All of them are specified. It's a list of finite categories.

C. The conjunction 'o' implies the possibility of choosing one or more from several items whereas in this example, the items have been classified into four types, no more no less. It is a statement, not a presentation of some items while omitting others.

D. Here the list is definitely complete. There are no more risks; these are all of them.

E. because four completely different categories are mentioned.

Text 5 (from a software user manual):

Gracias a su sencillo interfaz, podrá gestionar todas las tareas que necesite para la gestión de su servidor, clientes o dominios con total sencillez, a través de formularios Web intuitivos.

¿Why is the conjunction before 'dominios' 'o' and not 'y'?

Answers:

A. I understand that it is because they are independent processed and the interface lets you manage all of them; going a bit further (without understanding the subject a matter too much), I could think that it is because the client probably wouldn't use all three processes.

B. The subjunctive ‘necesite’ requires the conjunction ‘o’. the processes have been divided into three general categories but more could probably have been given. the list could have included other processes the programme can do.

C. The user decides what he/she wants to process with the interface, i.e. he/she can choose, that’s why ‘o’ is used.

D. There are two reasons: the management of the server, the management of clients and the management of domains have been considered as independent possibilities because they cannot be carried out at the same time (you either manage the server, clients or domains); also, the user doesn’t have to manage the server, the clients and domains, he/she might need only one of the processes mentioned.

E. I suppose that the management can be applied only to one of the three items (server, clients or domains) and not to two or three of them at the same time.

Text 6 (from a business school press release):

El Ayuntamiento de Madrid, TYPESA, Urbaser, Telefónica Móviles, Unión Fenosa, Avenue TWC, Indra o Santander Central Hispano son algunas de las instituciones que lideran este Foro.

¿Why is the conjunction before ‘Santander Central Hispano’ ‘o’ and not ‘y’?

Answers:

A. I think this is incorrect. If all these institutions lead the forum, ‘y’ has to be used.

B. They are examples of ‘some’ of the institutions that lead the forum. The list is not trying to mention all of them.

C. Because only *some* of the institutions are mentioned.

D. Not all the institutions are mentioned, only some of them (probably the most relevant ones).

E. Again, this is to indicate that the list does not represent all the institutions that take part in the forum. In any case, I would have sued ‘y’ instead of ‘o’ because afterwards it says ‘are some of the institutions that lead the forum’ and I think the ‘o’ is redundant.