Thank Goodness For That: Children’s Early Experiences of Regret and Relief

Daniel P Weisberg, Sarah R Beck

School of Psychology, University of Birmingham, UK. Contact: DXW401@bham.ac.uk

Introduction

Everyday, we compare what we have in reality to what could have been, be it small (e.g., “I should have left the house earlier, and then I wouldn’t be stuck in traffic”) or large (e.g., “If only I studied harder at school, I would be in a better job”). This thinking about what could have been is known as ‘counterfactual thinking’. Often, emotional reactions are experienced alongside these thoughts, known as ‘counterfactual emotions’, such as regret and relief. Although there is a great deal of research on adults’ counterfactual emotions, there is a scarce literature on the development of children’s experience of these emotions.

The only tasks that have been used are a games task in which participants themselves play a game involving decisions that led to regret or relief and a stories task, in which participants read about two protagonists who experience regret and relief because of their choices. Results from both studies suggest that children experience regret from 7, but neither provided positive evidence for the experience of relief.

Study 1: The Games Task

(Based on Amos & Smalley, 2000)

1. Participants choose between two boxes that contained differing quantities of stickers.

2. Rate their feelings about their chosen box.

3. View the contents of the non-chosen box.

4. Rate their feelings about their first box once again.

5. x regret trials (initial box contained 2 or 3 stickers; alternative box contained 8 stickers)

2 x relief trials (initial box contained 2 or 3 stickers; alternative box contained zero stickers)

Study 1: Participants & Results

N = 106

age 6-7: n = 32 mean age = 6.7 11 males

age 6-8: n = 33 mean age = 7.3 18 males

The 6-7 year-olds demonstrated regret as initial score subtracted from the second score differed from zero. Relief was shown in 7-8 year-olds. There is evidence of lag between regret and relief.

Study 2: Methods

N = 162

age 4-5: n = 55 mean age = 4.5 29 males

age 6-7: n = 55 mean age = 6.7 31 males

1. Choose one of two face-down cards

2. Rate happiness of the contents on a 5-point scale

3. View the contents of the non-chosen card

4. Re-rate feelings of the contents of the first box using the blue arrows: even sadder, the same, even happier than before

5. Difference between the ratings is compared to zero

Study 2: Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regret-Win</th>
<th>Regret-Lose</th>
<th>Relief-Win</th>
<th>Relief-Lose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W23, W9</td>
<td>L23, W9</td>
<td>W23, L3</td>
<td>L23, L8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-5</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 6-7</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-7</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percentages of arrows chosen, Binomial Sign Tests, proportions = .33. Highlighted columns represent the arrow expected to be chosen.

The 4-5 year-olds demonstrated a limited experience of regret, three years younger than initially suggested. Apart from the 4-5 year-olds’ abilities, regret and relief develop in parallel from 5-6 years, apart from relief-loss, at 6-7 years. This is once more positive evidence for relief, two years younger than our first games task.

Study 2: Discussion and Conclusions

We provide unique evidence that children can experience some form of regret at 4-5 years, 3 years younger than we and the literature initially anticipated. We also found the first positive evidence that children from 5 possess the necessary cognitive skills in order to experience regret and relief. These emotions are pervasive in adults and it seems that they develop from a young age. Discovering their function requires further work so it may be possible that young children learn from their regrets just as adults do.

Our three initial limitations were investigated. We have evidence that children think counterfactually after negative outcomes, but not necessarily only negative outcomes, more meaningful gains and losses are more likely to trigger regret and relief, and the flexible scale permitted more reliable responding.

It is not until children are 6-7 that they think counterfactually after a negative outcome on the relief-loss trials. The delay in success may be due to this being a learned response. As adults, we attempt to find positives after negative events, such as failing in an activity, yet children do not acquire the skills to do so until at least 6-7 years.

Thus trying to prompt children that a negative outcome could have been worse (e.g., on consoling a child with a broken toy “at least you have something to play with”), may fall on uncomprehending ears.

References


Ginn ey @ 2000)

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Rhiannon Jones and Jane Barrett for their help recruiting participants. We would also like to thank the Birmingham City Council for their support.

We are also grateful to the young people who participated in this research. This research was supported by an Economic and Physical Sciences Research Council Grant (EP 193741361.01).