Values in Mental Health Legislation

2 Simon’s Story

12.10.2016

Bill Fulford and Tamsin Waterhouse

Collaborating Centre for Values-based Practice
St Catherine’s College, Oxford
Outline …

1. Simon’s story

2. Three interpretations

3. Values-based practice (VBP) in mental health assessment
Outline …

1. Simon’s story

2. Three interpretations

3. Values-based practice (VBP) in mental health assessment
Simon’s Story
Delusional perception …

‘… based on sensory experiences … ‘ and involves ‘… suddenly becoming convinced that a particular set of events has a special meaning.’

(Present State Examination)
The ICD-10 Classification of Mental and Behavioural Disorders

Clinical descriptions and diagnostic guidelines

World Health Organization
In ICD-10…

Simon has a psychotic illness
Simon’s Story
continued
DSM 5 and RDoC

RDoC for research

DSM for clinical work

Thomas R. Insel, M.D.
NIMH Director
Criterion B for Schizophrenia in DSM-5

For a significant portion of the time since the onset of the disturbance, level of functioning in one or more major areas, such as work, interpersonal relations, or self-care, is markedly below the level achieved prior to the onset (or when the onset is in childhood or adolescence, there is failure to achieve expected levels of interpersonal, academic, or occupational functioning).

The Evidence-Base of DSM
The Evidence-Base of DSM

DSM-IV will be based on …

• “… an extensive empirical foundation”
• “… the breadth of available evidence”
• “… a formal evidence-based process for the Work Groups to follow”
• “… the widest pool of information”

(from Introduction to DSM-IV, page xv)
Criterion B (in DSM)

- DSM is explicitly evidence-based
- So, is Criterion B just a matter of evidence?
Criterion B for Schizophrenia in DSM-5

For a significant portion of the time since the onset of the disturbance, level of functioning in one or more major areas, such as work, interpersonal relations, or self-care, is markedly below the level achieved prior to the onset (or when the onset is in childhood or adolescence, there is failure to achieve expected levels of interpersonal, academic, or occupational functioning).

**Values in Criterion B for Schizophrenia in DSM-5**

For a significant portion of the time since the onset of the disturbance, level of functioning in one or more major areas, such as work, interpersonal relations, or self-care, is markedly **below** the level achieved prior to the onset (or when the onset is in childhood or adolescence, there is **failure** to achieve expected levels of interpersonal, academic, or occupational functioning).

In ICD…
Simon has a **psychotic illness**

In DSM…
Simon has a **spiritual experience**
• Two very different diagnoses
• Two very different diagnoses
• And the difference is a matter of values
John Sadler
Outline …

1. Simon’s story
   values in MH assessment

1. Three interpretations

2. Values-based practice (VBP) in mental health assessment
Outline …

1. Simon’s story

   Neuroscience **AND values** in MH assessment

1. Three interpretations

2. Values-based practice (VBP) in mental health assessment
Outline …

1. Simon’s story

2. Three interpretations

3. Values-based practice (VBP) in mental health assessment
Thomas Szasz … ‘mental illness a myth’
R. E. Kendell … ‘psychiatry a protoscience’
J. L. Austin

1950s Oxford
Analytic philosophy
R. M. Hare …
‘ordinary language philosophy of values’
The Third Interpretation

From R M Hare’s work in philosophical value theory …

EXPLICIT values reflect …

DIVERSITY of individual human values
The Third Interpretation

From R M Hare’s work in philosophical value theory …

EXPLICIT values in psychiatric diagnosis reflect …
DIVERSITY of individual human values
Moral theory and medical practice

K.W.M. Fulford
Outline …

1. Simon’s story
   Neuroscience AND values in MH assessment

2. Three interpretations
   Reflects diversity of values

3. Values-based practice (VBP) in mental health assessment
Outline …

1. Simon’s story

2. Three interpretations

3. Values-based practice (VBP) in mental health assessment
Values-based practice is about …

... diversity of individual human values
Values-based practice

Ten Key Process Elements

• 4 Clinical Skills
• 2 Aspects of the model of service delivery
• 3 Strong links between VBP and EBP
• Partnership in decision-making

Together these support balanced decision making within frameworks of shared values
Whose values?
A workbook for values-based practice in mental health care

Kim Woodbridge
Bill (K.W.M.) Fulford

Foreword by
Rosie Winterton MP
Minister of State
Department of Health
WHO and Department of Health

Comprehensive Diagnosis in the Context of Revision of Psychiatric Diagnostic and Classification Systems

16th & 17th November 2006
The Hempel Hotel, London
3 keys to a shared approach in mental health assessment

“This exciting document represents an important new contribution to our programme of increasing personalisation of services in health and social care.”

Iris Lisby MP, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Care Services

October 2008
A Shared Approach to Mental Health Assessment
A Shared Approach to Mental Health Assessment

‘Having a say in how our problems are understood’
The 3 Keys

1 **Person-centred**: *active partnership* with the service user concerned

2 **MDT**: drawing together *different provider perspectives*

3 **Strengths**: focusing on *individual strengths and resiliencies* as well as needs and difficulties
Outline …

1. Simon’s story
   Neuroscience AND values in MH assessment

2. Three interpretations
   Reflects diversity of values

3. Values-based practice (VBP) in mental health assessment
Summary

1. Simon’s story
   Neuroscience AND values in MH assessment

2. Three interpretations
   Reflects diversity of values

3. Values-based practice (VBP) in mental health assessment 3 Keys
How VBP changes applying mental health legislation: this afternoon

A VBP ‘tweak’ to my practice
St Catherine’s College, Oxford

Collaborating Centre for Values-based Practice

Valuesbasedpractice.org