

Critical Discourse Analysis of How Two  
Newspapers Reported the Treatment of Women at  
a Sumo Event in Japan

Christine Pemberton

Paper originally submitted July 2018 to the Department of English of the University of Birmingham, UK, as an assignment in Written Discourse, in partial fulfillment of a Master of Arts in Teaching English as a Foreign / Second Language (TEFL / TESL).

**WD/17/04**

Choose two news articles addressing the same event or topic, but from publications that differ in some socially significant way (e.g. political orientation, audience, country of publication). Critically discuss the differences between these articles, focusing on some of the following points:

- the narrative structure of the articles;
- the ways ‘news values’ influence the production of news;
- the underlying system of values/ideologies which shapes each report;
- the ways social actors are represented;
- the visual illustrations that accompany the texts.

**1 Introduction**

The purpose of journalism is to give people a better understanding of their lives and their place in society. By analyzing the news, we can understand to what extent it fulfills this purpose or fails to do so (Richardson, 2007: 7). This paper uses critical discourse analysis to examine two news reports of the same event which occurred at a sumo match in Kyoto, Japan. One report, offering an international perspective, is from the BBC. The other, from the Japanese newspaper Asahi Shimbun, provides a domestic point of view (see Appendix 1). Consideration will be given to the form and content of the reports as well as the social context in which they are produced and consumed in order to reveal their underlying ideologies.

**2 Background**

Sumo is a traditional Japanese sport where two male wrestlers face off with the objective of knocking down or pushing the opponent out of the ring (Japan Sumo Association, 2007). There have been several controversies in sumo including match-fixing (Buerk, 2011), gambling, and ties to the yakuza (Fackler, 2010a; 2010b). It is traditional in sumo that women are not allowed to enter the ring. In 2000, Fusae Ota, Japan’s first female governor,

requested to present a prize inside the ring at a match in Osaka, but her request was denied by the Japan Sumo Association (Hindell, 2000) (hereafter, the JSA). On April 4, 2018, mayor of Kyoto Ryozo Tatami collapsed while giving a speech at a sumo event. Several female spectators entered the ring to administer first aid but were ordered to leave by a referee. Afterward, an apology was issued by the head of the JSA. This event is the subject of the two articles selected for analysis.

### **3 Theoretical Background**

According to Fowler, all texts are filtered by an author who interprets the world through their own perceptions (1981: 108). Even news stories, though meant to be objective, are ultimately controlled by profit-driven news executives (Bell, 1991: 38). Critical discourse analysis is a tool which can be used to unlock the hidden ideologies and social meanings of such texts (Teo, 2000: 11) and to target the elites who perpetuate social inequality and injustice (van Dijk, 1993). Because discourse and social structure have a dialectical relationship (Fairclough, 1992: 63-64), analysis of discourse is important to uncover how discourse both represents the world and acts upon it. This paper will use CDA to determine how two different news agencies tell the same story with differing perspectives.

Various approaches have emerged for discourse analysis including political discourse theory, rhetorical political analysis, discourse historical analysis, interpretive policy analysis, discursive psychology, and Q methodology (Glynos et al., 2009). This paper will use Fairclough's (1992) model for its capacity to analyze texts through the three dimensions of text, discourse practice, and social practice. Text analysis concerns the form and function of the text itself, discourse practice considers the text's production, distribution, and

consumption, and social practice relates the text to a wider social context. Analysis may proceed in any order, but Richardson (2007) suggests moving from text to discourse practice and then social practice (from a micro to a macro level). At the level of text analysis, this paper will examine the lexical choices, narrative structure, and representation of social actors in the articles. At the level of discourse practice, news values, intertextuality, hypertext, and multimedia will be addressed. Finally, the underlying ideologies of the journalists will be discussed at the level of social practice.

## **4 Analysis**

The two reports selected for analysis come from BBC News Online and The Asahi Shimbun (hereafter, the AS). The BBC is a British internationally-recognized major newspaper available in 30 languages (BBC, 2018b) that aligns with a somewhat liberal ideology (Mitchell et al., 2014). The AS is one of Japan's major newspapers with both Japanese and English versions available and has been described as "left-leaning" by foreign media (Martin, 2014; The Wall Street Journal, 2014). Both newspapers released reports on the incident described in Section 2, which will be analyzed based on the framework described in Section 3.

### **4.1 Text Analysis**

#### **4.1.1 Narrative Structure**

There are multiple methods to determine the narrative structure of texts. Bolivar's (1994) model breaks sentences into *turns* which can be grouped into *movements* and *artefacts*. Richardson (2007) proposes the three-part structure of *setting*, *event*, and *outcome*. Labov and Waletzky's (1967) and Labov's (1972, cited in Bell, 1991: 148) model includes *abstract*,

*orientation, complicating action, evaluation, resolution, and coda.* This paper uses Bell's (1991) model because it is designed specifically for news stories. It includes:

- *Abstract*: includes headline and lead
- *Attribution*: includes agency credit, journalist's byline, place, and time
- *Story*: includes one or more episodes, which consist of one or more events
- *Events*: include attribution, actors, setting, action, follow-up, commentary, and background

The lead focuses a story in a particular direction (Bell, 1991: 152) and represents the abstract of the story. The leads of each report are shown in Table 1.

*Table 1: Leads*

BBC News	Asahi Shimbun
Women who rushed to perform first aid on a man who collapsed in a sumo ring in Japan were ordered by a referee to leave the ring, because females are banned from the space.	MAIZURU, Kyoto Prefecture--The Japan Sumo Association chairman has apologized after women who were trying to save the life of the mayor, who suddenly collapsed during a sumo event here on April 4, were ordered to leave the dohyo.

Each lead focuses on different aspects of the story. Although the outcome of a story is typically reported first, taking on an "inverted pyramid" structure, (Bell, 1991: 172; Richardson, 2007: 71), the BBC does not include the apology of the chairman, the most recent event, in the lead. Instead, they focus solely on the more negative act of ordering the women to leave the ring. The AS, on the other hand, mentions the apology first, softening the impact of the referee's remarks. The BBC lead also states that women are banned from the sumo ring, while the AS lead does not. This may be because an international audience

would be less familiar with this fact than a domestic one, or it could be that the BBC wants to highlight the sexist practice while the AS does not. Finally, even though time and place are typically high priorities in news reporting (Bell, 1991: 198), the BBC lead does not give specific details of city or date, placing the entire nation of Japan under scrutiny.

There were similarities and differences in how each report presents the story. Appendices 2.1 and 2.2 analyze the structure of the two reports. Table 2 presents the elements of the story chronologically and in the order they appear in each report.

*Table 2: Story elements and narrative structure*

<b>Chronological Elements of the Story</b>	
Background	History of women and sumo
Background	Previous episode with female Osaka governor Fusae Ota
Event 1	Action: Maizuru mayor Ryozo Tatami collapses. Follow-up: The mayor is in stable condition. Setting: the Maizuru Sumo Grand Tournament at 2PM Background: part of the Spring Circuit Tour
Event 2	Action: Several women enter the sumo ring to help.
Event 3	Action: The referee orders the women to leave the ring. Follow-up: The JSA chairman apologizes.
Event 4	Action: Male ambulance crew members take over.
Event 5	Action: JSA staff sprinkle salt on the ring. Follow-up: reactions from Twitter (BBC) and a JSA official (AS) Background: meaning of salt in sumo
<b>Narrative Structure of the Articles</b>	
<b>BBC News</b>	<b>Asahi Shimbun</b>
Abstract: headline	Abstract: headline
Abstract: lead	Abstract: lead
Background: history	Background: history
Event 2: action	Event 3: follow-up (reaction), action
Event 1: action	Event 1: action, setting, background (history)
Event 3: follow-up (reaction)	Event 2: action
Event 5: action, background (history), follow-up (reaction)	Event 4: action
Event 1: follow up (consequence)	Event 3: action
Background: previous episode	Event 1: follow-up (consequence)
	Event 5: action, background (history), follow-up (reaction)
	Background: previous episode

Both reports begin by explaining the history of women and sumo and end with a previous related episode. Regarding Event 1, the AS gives more information than the BBC about the setting and history of the sumo event and gives more information at an earlier point about Tatami's condition. The BBC presents Events 2 and 3 in chronological order, while the AS places the follow-up reaction to Event 3, the apology of the JSA chairman, ahead of Event 2. This mirrors the precedence the AS gives to the apology in the lead. The JSA also gives more details about Event 3 later in the article. The BBC does not include Event 4, where male ambulance crew members take over rescue efforts. Regarding Event 5, where salt is sprinkled in the ring, both reports include the action, background, and follow-up reactions from different sources. All in all, the sexism issue takes the main role in the BBC report, while the AS report includes a greater variety of other details.

#### 4.1.2 Lexical Choices

Richardson (2007: 47-48) explains that the words used to communicate a message in a text unavoidably act as ideological constraints. Fairclough (1992: 191) states that “as one changes the wording, one also changes the meaning.” In other words, meaning itself changes based on the words used to represent it. This goes hand in hand with Halliday's assertion that text is the realization of meaning potential (1975: 195). Table 3 illustrates contrasting lexical choices from the articles.

*Table 3: Contrasting lexical choices*

Topic	BBC	Asahi Shimbun
History of women and sumo	<p>Women who rushed to perform first aid on a man who collapsed in a sumo ring in Japan were ordered by a referee to leave the ring, because females are <b>banned</b> from the space.</p> <p>The ring is regarded as <b>sacred</b> and women, traditionally seen as</p>	Traditionally, women are <b>barred</b> from entering the sumo ring.

	" <b>impure</b> ", are <b>forbidden</b> from entering.  Women are <b>not permitted in</b> the sumo wrestling ring as they are seen as " <b>impure</b> " (image caption)	
Chairman Hakkaku's apology	"We <b>deeply</b> apologise."	"We would like to offer a <b>profound</b> apology."
History of throwing salt in sumo	In Japanese culture, salt is thrown into the sumo ring before a match to <b>purify</b> it. Some on social media said the gesture implied that the women had " <b>dirtied</b> " the ring.	In sumo tournaments, this <b>purification</b> ritual is often conducted before a bout and when a wrestler is injured.
Previous episode with Governor Ota	In 2000, the then governor of Osaka Fusae Ota asked the sumo association to allow her to enter the ring so she could present a trophy to the champion wrestler, but her request was <b>rejected</b> .	The JSA, however, showed <b>reluctance to granting her request</b> , and the governor finally gave up.

Regarding the history of women and sumo, the AS used one word— “barred” while the BBC uses three— “banned,” “not permitted in,” and the much stronger “forbidden.” The BBC emphasizes the notion of purity by using “impure” twice to describe women, “sacred” to describe the sumo ring, and “purify” and “dirtied” to describe the history of throwing salt. While the AS does call salt-throwing a “purification ritual”, it is only in the context of beginning a match or when a player is injured. Regarding the previous episode with Governor Ota, the BBC says her request was “rejected,” a stronger word choice than the AS’s “reluctance to grant her request.” Lastly, the apology of Chairman Hakkaku sounds weaker with the BBC’s use of “deeply” compared to the AS’s “profound.” In Hakkaku’s original Japanese statement (Nakazawa, 2018), the word 深<(fukaku) is used, which translates correctly to either English word. In all instances except the apology, the BBC has more extreme word choices, painting a more negative picture of the situation.



### 4.1.3 Social Actors

There are multiple ways to analyze how social actors, the people who act and are acted upon, are represented in news stories. Most relevant to these particular news reports are predication, transitivity, and modality.

#### 4.1.3.1 Predication

Predication refers to how qualities are assigned to individuals (Reisigl and Wodak, 2001, as cited in Richardson, 2007: 52-53). In van Leeuwen's (1995: 39) discussion of exclusion, he explains how social actors may be de-emphasized to push them into the background.

Appendix 3, representing how both reports predicate social actors, shows that the AS mentions women in general one time to the BBC's five times. By focusing on only the specific women involved, the AS does not make it into a feminist issue but rather focuses on the facts of the incident itself. The BBC, perhaps attempting to focus on the sexism issue, backgrounds Mayor Tatami, who is mentioned three times to the AS's six times. He is also referred to only as "a man" in the BBC's lead, and his age is mentioned only in the AS article.

Van Leeuwen (1995: 52) also discusses nomination and categorization, wherein social actors are represented either by their unique identity or by the identity that they have in common with others. The women and referee are not nominated in either report, perhaps because newspapers place more value on those in positions of authority (Fowler, 1991; Bell, 1991) (see Section 4.2.1). With predications like "women who rushed to perform aid," the BBC focuses on the women's life-saving quality. Predication in the AS branches out to also call them "spectators" and relates them to the mayor with "women trying to save mayor's life." Also, the BBC focuses on their nationality by calling them "Japanese women" in the

headline, while this information is assumed in the AS report. The AS, but not the BBC, uses the Japanese word *gyoji* to represent the referee, as this word is specific to sumo referees only. Thus, some differences distinctly related to cultural viewpoint become apparent.

#### 4.1.3.2 Transitivity

Transitivity relates to Halliday's ideational function and concerns the way actions are represented (Richardson, 2007: 54; Fairclough, 1992: 178; Fowler, 1991: 70). The reports share similarities and differences in terms of active and passive sentence construction. Both use passive sentences with no agent to explain the history of women and sumo, the use of salt in sumo, and the medical condition of Mayor Tatami. Table 4 indicates where sentence construction differs.

Table 4: *Contrasting transitivity*

Example #	BBC	Asahi Shimbun
1	Women who rushed to perform first aid on a man who collapsed in a sumo ring in Japan <b>were ordered by a referee</b> to leave the ring, because females are banned from the space.	The Japan Sumo Association chairman has apologized after women who were trying to save the life of the mayor, who suddenly collapsed during a sumo event here on April 4, <b>were ordered</b> to leave the dohyo.  During the emergency, the women <b>were ordered</b> to leave at least three times in announcements made over the public address system.
2	Local reports later emerged that <b>spectators saw</b> salt being thrown into the ring after the women had left.	Some spectators said that after the women left the dohyo, <b>staff associated with the JSA sprinkled</b> a large amount of salt in the ring.
3	"The announcement [to get off the stage] <b>was made by a referee</b> who was upset, but it was an inappropriate act in a situation that involves one's	"This instruction was inappropriate under such life-and-death

	life," Nobuyoshi Hakkaku, the sumo association's chief said in a statement.	circumstances. <b>The gyoji did</b> it because he was upset," Hakkaku said.
4	In 2000, the then governor of Osaka Fusae Ota asked <b>the sumo association</b> to allow her to enter the ring so she could present a trophy to the champion wrestler, but her request <b>was rejected</b> .	<b>The JSA</b> , however, <b>showed</b> reluctance to granting her request, and <b>the governor</b> finally <b>gave up</b> .

In Example 1, both reports use passive construction, but the BBC points blame by specifying the referee as agent. In Example 2, the AS specifies the JSA staff as agent while the BBC omits them and emphasizes the spectators. Example 3 shows different translations of Hakkaku's original statement where the BBC uses a passive construction and the AS uses an active one. This may be due to the ambiguous nature of translation. In Example 4, the BBC uses a passive construction with the agent "the sumo association" in the previous clause. The AS uses active construction with "the governor" as agent, transferring responsibility for the decision to her and minimizing the rejection. To summarize, in Examples 1 and 4, the BBC lays more blame on the JSA than the AS does, but the opposite seems to be true in Example 2, and Example 3 seems to be a simple translation difference.

#### **4.1.3.3 Modality**

Modality, relating to Halliday's interpersonal function, refers to the attitude or judgments made by the author (Richardson, 2007: 59; Fairclough, 1992: 158; Fowler, 1991: 85). Both reports avoid modality except for the quotations from outside sources regarding the salt-throwing incident. The Twitter quotations used by the BBC express disapproval of the action, while the JSA official's statement used by the AS expresses belief that it was not ill-intended. By selecting these particular quotations, both news organizations can indirectly assert opinions about the event while still preserving their image of journalistic objectivity.

## 4.2 Discourse Practice

### 4.2.1 News Values

New events are not intrinsically newsworthy but are selected as news based on socially constructed categories which reflect the ideology of news organizations (Hall et al., 1978: 53). These categories, called news values, were classically defined by Galtung and Ruge (1965), were added to by Bell (1991), and were revised by Harcup and O’Neill (2001). The three sets of criteria overlap as illustrated in Table 5. Values that apply, do not apply, or partially apply to each report are labelled “yes”, “no”, or “y/n”, respectively. Term definitions appear in Appendix 4.

*Table 5: News values*

Galtung and Ruge		Bell	Harcup and O’Neill	BBC	AS
frequency				yes	yes
threshold:	absolute intensity	superlativeness	magnitude	yes	yes
	intensity increase			no	no
unambiguity		unambiguity		y/n	y/n
		facticity		y/n	y/n
meaningfulness:	cultural proximity	proximity		no	yes
	relevance	relevance	relevance	no	yes
		recency		yes	yes
consonance:	predictability	predictability		no	no
	demand	consonance	entertainment	yes	no
unexpectedness:	unpredictability	unexpectedness	surprise	yes	no
	scarcity			yes	yes
continuity		continuity	follow-ups	yes	yes
composition		composition	media agenda	yes	yes
reference to elite nations		eliteness	the power elite	yes	yes
reference to elite people				yes	yes
		attribution		y/n	yes
			celebrity	no	no
personification		personalization		y/n	y/n
reference to something negative		negativity	bad news	yes	yes
			good news	no	no
		competition		yes	yes
		co-option		no	no
		prefabrication		yes	no

Some differences are present. First, the BBC does not have cultural proximity to this story, and the event is more relevant to a Japanese audience since all social actors are Japanese.

Another difference is in relation to demand/consonance/entertainment. Although this negative story may be concerning to a domestic audience, an international audience may enjoy a sense of superiority by pointing out sexism in a country known to have a large gender gap (World Economic Forum, 2017). The final difference is with prefabrication. Since the event happened in Japan, there is a good chance that the BBC based its report on news reports from Japan, perhaps even on the AS report.

Unambiguity, facticity, and personification/personalization only apply to each report to some extent. Regarding unambiguity, the women being ordered out of the ring is fairly straightforward, but the reason the salt was thrown afterward is unclear. The AS deals with this issue by giving an ambivalent yet optimistic statement from a JSA official. The BBC quotes Twitter users who are more critical, ignoring the news value of attribution in favor of negativity. In terms of facticity, neither article mentions how many women entered the ring, but other information such as the location of the event is given, with more details included in the AS report. Concerning personification/personalization, the main actors are not identified, yet those in positions of authority are named. In this way, the sumo association and the women of Japan, two clashing social forces, are embodied through these representative figures.

#### **4.2.2 Intertextuality**

Bakhtin (1986: 109) asserts that each utterance relates to, is shaped by, and is pervaded by other utterances. Fairclough's (1992) model of CDA uses this intertextual approach to understand how one text relates to and incorporates other texts on internal and external axes (Richardson, 2007). In journalism, the external axis relates to the running story, which in the two reports is about Governor Ota's rejection by the JSA (examined in sections 4.1.2 and

4.1.3.2). The internal axis relates to quotations and reported speech, which may be classified as direct quotations, indirect quotations, narrative reports of speech acts (NRSA) (Fairclough, 2003: 49), or integrated quotations, which mix direct and indirect forms (Calsamiglia & Ferrero, 2003: 155). Also relevant is “accessed voice,” the concept that those in power are frequently given voice in news reports while women and minorities are underrepresented (Hartley, 1982, cited in Caldas-Coulthard, 1994: 304 & Fowler, 1991: 22; Teo, 2000: 18; van Dijk, 1993: 255). Tables 6 and 7 indicate quotation types and sources used in both reports.

*Table 6: BBC Quotation types and sources*

BBC		Quotation Source								
		Referee	JSA	Committee	Spectator	Twitter	Ota	Unnamed	Total	Proportion
Quotation Type	Direct Quote	0	1	0	0	2	0	0	3	30%
	Indirect Quote	0	0	0	1	1	1	0	3	30%
	Integrated	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0%
	NRSA*	2	2	0	0	0	0	0	4	40%
	Total	2	3	0	1	3	1	0	10	
	Proportion	20%	30%	0%	10%	30%	10%	0%		

\*NRSA: narrative report of speech act

*Table 7: AS Quotation types and sources*

AS		Quotation Source								
		Referee	JSA	Committee	Spectator	Twitter	Ota	Unnamed	Total	Proportion
Quotation Type	Direct Quote	1	2	0	0	0	0	0	3	23%
	Indirect Quote	0	0	1	1	0	1	1	4	31%
	Integrated	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	1**	8%
	NRSA*	3	2	0	0	0	0	0	5	38%
	Total	5	5	1	1	0	1	1	13 types/ 14 sources	
	Proportion	36%	36%	7%	7%	0%	7%	7%		

\*NRSA: narrative report of speech act  
\*\*one integrated quotation combining quotations from referee and JSA

Similarities and differences are apparent. Both reports include more than one NRSA by the referee and JSA. Both give direct quotations by the JSA and indirect quotations by spectators and Governor Ota. Only the BBC gives quotations from Twitter users, while only the AS

gives a direct quotation from the referee, indirect quotations from committee members and unnamed sources, and an integrated quotation which combines an indirect quotation from the JSA and a direct quotation from the referee. Regarding the salt-throwing incident, as discussed in Sections 4.1.3.3 and 4.2.1, the AS quotes an optimistic JSA official, while the BBC quotes more critical Twitter users. These choices help to guide readers' perceptions. Finally, of the seven sources quoted in total, neither report offers any type of quotation from the women who climbed into the ring. This is congruent with Caldas-Coulthard's (1994) finding that women are consistently silenced in the media and seems especially noteworthy in a story referencing gender equality issues.

### 4.2.3 Multimedia

Kress and van Leeuwen (1999) discuss how images are used to represent relationships between and among the people in an image (represented participants) and the people showing or viewing the image (interactive participants). Images may be analyzed in terms of the gaze of represented participants, frame size, and angle. The images used in the reports are shown below.

*Image 1: BBC report's first image*



*Image 2: BBC report's second image*



*Image 3: AS report's image*



The BBC report begins with a stock photo from Getty Images (Image 1). Such photos tend to be generic, timeless, and have low modality (i.e. a more general, connotative meaning) (Machin and Leeuwen, 2007). A reverse image search reveals that Image 1 was actually taken at the Grand Sumo Tournament in Las Vegas in 2005, but it is used to represent sumo in general because the represented participants' faces and the background are not visible. The image is placed immediately after the headline, setting the tone for the report and introducing sumo to an international audience. The gaze of the represented participants is



away from the camera, the frame is at a far social distance, and the angle is high above them. The viewer's gaze is at a 90-degree angle to the wrestlers and aligns with that of the referee, looking over his shoulder at the scene. These factors place the viewer into the position of detached evaluator, ready to make judgments about sumo and its practices.

Image 2 from the BBC and Image 3 from the AS appear to have been taken by spectators at the actual event. The AS cites a reader as the image's source, implying AS reporters have connections to locals who were there. The BBC cites Reuters, one of the "Big Four" news agencies (Bell, 1991: 48), which shows BBC reporters do not have such direct access and must go through other sources. Neither image features eye contact between represented participants and the camera, inviting the viewer to look on as yet another spectator in the crowd. The BBC image has a closer frame focused on the spectators who entered the ring with an angle parallel to two of the female actors. This places the viewer closer to the action and makes it easier to identify with the women. The AS image has a more distant frame, a higher angle, and lower image quality. The legs of the collapsed mayor are visible, but the gender of those around him is indiscernible. Thus, the AS focuses on the event as a whole and includes the mayor as an important participant.

### **4.3 Social Practice: Ideologies**

Ideologies may be understood through their relationship to systems of power. According to Fairclough, ideologies are "significations/constructions of reality (the physical world, social relations, social identities), which are built into various dimensions of the forms/meanings of discursive practices, and which contribute to the production, reproduction, or transformation of relations of domination" (1992: 87). Because "production" and "reproduction" likely relate to difference discursive practices, it is important to differentiate them (Holland, 2006:

42). Richardson (2007: 134) describes ideology as maintaining systems of dominance and also emphasizes the dialectical relationship between journalism and the values of society (114). Geertz (1973: 201), discussing the social determinants of ideology, describes the interest theory, involving a universal struggle for advantage, and the strain theory, involving an effort to correct social imbalance.

Ideological considerations for the reports deal with women's rights and nationalism. The UK ranked 15<sup>th</sup> in the Global Gender Gap Report 2017 compared to Japan at 114<sup>th</sup> (World Economic Forum, 2017), and Japan is often criticized for its sexism by foreign media (for example: The Economist, 2017; Woods, 2017; Smart, 2014). As shown in Sections 4.1 and 4.2, the BBC report emphasizes the injustice done to the women in the story while the AS attempts to nullify the impact of the incident. By presenting the incident as further evidence of Japan's sexism problem, the BBC helps to maintain the UK's dominant status as a leader in global gender equality. The AS's attempts to downplay it serve to mitigate the negative impact it could have on Japan's already poor reputation, and their emphasis of the apology by the JSA chairman helps show sumo in a more positive and progressive light. The fact that the women involved are not nominated or quoted in either report shows that less priority is given to the sexism issue and more is given to preserving each country's respective status.

## **5 Discussion**

Although the results of this analysis cannot be generalized to represent all Japanese or international media, it is a helpful example of how women's equality issues can become tools to maintain or transform relationships of domination between nations. The BBC report excludes certain details and gives precedence to the women in the narrative structure, uses

more extreme lexical choices to paint a more negative picture, predicates women in general more frequently to make it a women's issue, and predicates the women involved based on their life-saving qualities. The BBC also uses transitivity to place more blame on the referee and the JSA, quotes Twitter users who criticize the JSA, and uses images which invite readers to judge sumo and empathize with the women involved. The AS focuses more on details which are unrelated to the sexism issue in the narrative structure, uses less intense lexical choices to soften the impact, does not give much predication to women in general to make it less of a sexism issue, and predicates the women involved by focusing on their other qualities such as their relation to Mayor Tatami. The AS also uses transitivity to avoid blaming the referee and the JSA, quotes a JSA official who skirts blame for the salt-throwing, and uses an image that focuses less on the women. News values in the reports differ with the story being more culturally relevant for a Japanese audience and more entertaining for an international audience. The ideologies for both reports deal with women's rights to an extent, but more priority is given to protecting national ranking.

## **6 Conclusion**

While the BBC and AS are both considered to be liberal media, CDA of these reports reveals some bias in favor of each respective country. Further research on larger data sets is required and could examine more reports of this event from other domestic and international news sources or perhaps focus on other related stories about women and sumo. Discrimination against women for the sake of preserving traditions continues to be a concern in Japan and other countries, and the way these stories are reported depends on the specific inclinations of those who control news outlets. These reports may distort or misrepresent information, which in turn can influence public opinion. As Fowler says, "There is not necessarily any

true reality that can be unveiled by critical practice, there are simply relatively varying representations” (1995: 4). Through CDA, the textual features, social context, and ideological preferences of news can be brought to light in order to better understand how reality is portrayed.

## References

- The Asahi Shimbun (2018) 'Women trying to save mayor's life ordered out of sumo ring', *The Asahi Shimbun* [online] Available at: <http://www.asahi.com/ajw/articles/AJ201804050040.html> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Bakhtin, M. M. (1986) *Speech genres and other late essays*. Translated from Russian by V. W. McGee. Austin, Texas: University of Texas Press.
- Bolivar, A. (1994) 'The structure of newspaper articles', in Coulthard, M. (ed.) *Advances in written text analysis*. London: Routledge.
- Buerk, R. (2011) 'Japan's sumo hit by match-fixing claim', *BBC* [online]. Available at: <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-asia-pacific-12342670> (Accessed 23 June 2018).
- Bell, A. (1991) *The language of news media*. Reprint, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 1996.
- BBC (2018a) 'Japanese women ordered from sumo ring during first aid', *BBC* [online]. Available at: <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-43652428> (Accessed 23 June 2018).
- BBC (2018b) 'Homepage', *BBC* [online]. Available at: <http://www.bbc.com/> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Caldas-Coulthard, C. R. (1994) 'On reporting reporting: the representation of speech in factual and factional narratives', in Coulthard, M. (ed.) *Advances in written text analysis*. London: Routledge.
- Calsamiglia, H., and Ferrero, C. L. (2003) 'Role and position of scientific voices: reported speech in the media', *Discourse Studies*, 5 (2), pp. 147-173.
- The Economist (2014) 'A string of errors damage a leading paper', *The Economist* [online]. Available at: <https://www.economist.com/news/asia/21618895-string-errors-damage-leading-paper-gotcha> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- The Economist (2017) 'No one is well-served by sexism in Japan', *The Economist* [online]. Available at: <https://www.economist.com/asia/2017/07/13/no-one-is-well-served-by-sexism-in-japan> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Fackler, M. (2010a) 'Sumo figures barred in Japan for gambling', *New York Times* [online]. Available at: [https://www.nytimes.com/2010/07/05/world/asia/05sumo.html?\\_r=1&scp=1&sq=sumo%20gambling&st=cse](https://www.nytimes.com/2010/07/05/world/asia/05sumo.html?_r=1&scp=1&sq=sumo%20gambling&st=cse) (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Fackler, M. (2010b) 'Sumo's ties to Japan underworld go beyond limits', *New York Times* [online]. Available at: <https://www.nytimes.com/2010/07/06/world/asia/06sumo.html?pagewanted=1&hp> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Fairclough, N. (1992) *Discourse and social change*. Reprint, Cambridge: Polity Press, 2006.

- Fairclough, N. (2003) *Analyzing discourse: textual analysis for social research*. London: Routledge.
- Fowler, R. (1981) *Literature as social discourse*. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press.
- Fowler, R. (1991) *Language in the news: discourse and ideology in the press*. Reprint, New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Fowler, R. (1995) 'On critical linguistics', in Caldas-Coulthard, C. R., and Coulthard, M. (eds.) *Texts and practices: readings in critical discourse analysis*. London: Routledge.
- Galtung, J., and Ruge, M. H. (1965) 'The structure of foreign news', *Journal of Peace Research*, 2 (2), pp. 64-91.
- Geertz, C. (1973) *The interpretation of cultures*. New York: Basic Books, Inc.
- Glynos, J., Howarth, D., Norval, A., and Speed, E. (2009) 'Discourse analysis: varieties and methods', *ESRC National Center for Research Methods*, 14, pp. 1-41.
- Hall, S., Critcher, C., Jefferson, T., Clark, J., and Roberts, B. (1978) *Policing the crisis: mugging, the state, and law and order*. Reprint, London: The Macmillan Press Ltd, 1982.
- Halliday, M. (1975) 'Language as social semiotic: towards a general sociolinguistic theory', in Makkai, A., and Makkai, V. (eds.) *The first LACUS forum: proceedings*. California: Hornbeam Press.
- Harcup, T., and O'Neill, D. (2001) 'What is news? Galtung and Ruge revisited', *Journalism Studies*, 2 (2), pp. 261-280.
- Hartley, J. (1982) *Understanding news*. London: Routledge.
- Hindell, J. (2000) 'Sumo excludes woman governor', *BBC* [online]. Available at: <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/asia-pacific/662040.stm> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Holland, R. (2006) '(De-) rationalizing the irrational: discourse as culture/ideology', *Critical Discourse Studies* [online], 3 (1), pp. 37-59. Available from: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/17405900600589366?scroll=top&needAccess=true&instName=University+of+Birmingham> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Kress, G., and van Leeuwen, T. (1999) 'Visual interaction', in Jaworski, A., and Coupland, N. (eds.) *The discourse reader* 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Reprint, London: Routledge, 2006.
- Labov, J. (1972) 'The transformation of experience in narrative syntax', in Labov, J. (ed.) *Language in the inner city*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Labov, J., and Waletzky, J. (1967) 'Narrative analysis: oral versions of personal experience',

- in Helm, J. (ed.) *Essays on the verbal and visual arts*. Seattle: University of Washington Press.
- Machin, D., and van Leeuwen, T. (2007) *Global media discourse: a critical introduction*. London: Routledge.
- Martin, A. (2014) 'President of Japanese newspaper apologizes for errors', *The Wall Street Journal* [online]. Available at: <https://www.wsj.com/articles/president-of-major-japanese-newspaper-apologizes-for-errors-1410439554> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Mitchell, A., Gottfried, J., Kiley, J., and Matsa, K. E. (2014) 'Political polarization and media habits', *Pew Research Center* [online]. Available at: <http://www.journalism.org/2014/10/21/political-polarization-media-habits/> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Nakazawa, S. (2018) 'Sumō enjō: kyūmei josei ni mukatte "dohyō kara orite" mondai, anaansu ni tsuite nihon sumō kyōkai ga shazai', *Rocket News 24* [online] Available at: <https://rocketnews24.com/2018/04/05/1041571/> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Nihon Sumo Kyokai (2007) 'Origin of sumo', *Nihon Sumo Kyokai* [online]. Available at: [https://web.archive.org/web/20070516101050/http://sumo.goo.ne.jp:80/eng/ozumo\\_joho\\_kyoku/shiru/kiso\\_chishiki/beginners\\_guide/origin.html](https://web.archive.org/web/20070516101050/http://sumo.goo.ne.jp:80/eng/ozumo_joho_kyoku/shiru/kiso_chishiki/beginners_guide/origin.html) (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Reisigl, M., and Wodak, R. (2001) *Discourse and discrimination: rhetorics of racism and antisemitism*. London: Routledge.
- Richardson, J. E. (2007) *Analyzing newspapers: an approach from critical discourse analysis*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Smart, R. (2014) 'Is Shinzo Abe's notion of 'womenomics' just a pipe dream in sexist Japan?', *Time* [online] Available at: <http://time.com/2980899/abe-womenomics-japan-economy-sexism-women/> (Accessed: 23 June 2016).
- Teo, P. (2000) 'Racism in the news: a critical discourse analysis of news reporting in two Australian newspapers', *Discourse & Society*, 11 (1) pp. 7-49.
- van Dijk, T. A. (1993) 'Principles of critical discourse analysis', *Discourse and Society*, 4 (2) pp. 249-283.
- van Leeuwen, T. (1995) 'The representation of social actors', in Caldas-Coulthard C. R., and Coulthard, M. (eds.) *Texts and practices: readings in critical discourse analysis*. London: Routledge.
- World Economic Forum (2017) 'The global gender gap report 2017', *World Economic Forum* [online]. Available at: <https://www.weforum.org/reports/the-global-gender-gap-report-2017> (Accessed: 23 June 2018).
- Woods, V. P. (2017) 'What I learned about sexism as an office lady in Japan', *Huffington Post* [online]. Available at: [https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/what-i-learned-about-sexism-as-an-office-lady-in-japan\\_us\\_59ceff06e4b0f58902e5cc52](https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/what-i-learned-about-sexism-as-an-office-lady-in-japan_us_59ceff06e4b0f58902e5cc52) (Accessed: 23 June 2018).

23 June 2018).



## Appendix 1: Reports

### Appendix 1.1: *BBC*

# Japanese women ordered from sumo ring during first aid

5 April 2018



Image copyright GETTY IMAGES Image caption Women are forbidden from entering the sumo ring

**Women who rushed to perform first aid on a man who collapsed in a sumo ring in Japan were ordered by a referee to leave the ring, because females are banned from the space.**

The ring is regarded as sacred and women, traditionally seen as "impure", are forbidden from entering.

They ran into the ring when Maizuru city mayor Ryozo Tatami collapsed while giving a speech.

The head of Japan's sumo association later apologised to the women.

"The announcement [to get off the stage] was made by a referee who was upset, but it was an inappropriate act in a situation that involves one's life," Nobuyoshi Hakkaku, the sumo association's chief said in a statement.

"We deeply apologise."

Local reports later emerged that spectators saw salt being thrown into the ring after the women had left.

In Japanese culture, salt is thrown into the sumo ring before a match to purify it. Some on social media said the gesture implied that the women had "dirtied" the ring.



Image copyright REUTERS

Image caption Women are not permitted in the sumo wrestling ring as they are seen as "impure"

"How rude is it that they threw salt to cleanse the ring after the women went in?" one Japanese Twitter user said.

"This is the response to someone who tried to save a life? I think we'd better sprinkle salt on the head of the sumo association," another added.

Mr Tatami was taken to hospital and is in a stable condition.

It is not the first time women entering the sumo ring has sparked controversy.

In 2000, the then governor of Osaka Fusae Ota asked the sumo association to allow her to enter the ring so she could present a trophy to the champion wrestler, but her request was rejected.

## Appendix 1.2: *Asahi Shimbun*

### Women trying to save mayor's life ordered out of sumo ring

THE ASAHI SHIMBUN  
April 5, 2018 at 15:45 JST



Women spectators and emergency workers administer life-saving assistance on the dohyo to Ryozo Tatami, mayor of Maizuru, Kyoto Prefecture, on April 4. (Provided by a reader)

MAIZURU, Kyoto Prefecture--The Japan Sumo Association chairman has apologized after women who were trying to save the life of the mayor, who suddenly collapsed during a sumo event here on April 4, were ordered to leave the dohyo.

Traditionally, women are barred from entering the sumo ring.

Hakkaku, Japan Sumo Association chairman, acknowledged that a "gyoji" (referee) who belongs to the JSA announced over the public address system more than once, "Ladies, please leave the dohyo."

"We would like to offer a profound apology. This instruction was inappropriate under such life-and-death circumstances. The gyoji did it because he was upset," Hakkaku said.

Ryozo Tatami, 67, mayor of the city, suddenly collapsed shortly after 2 p.m. while he was making a speech on the dohyo on the occasion of the Maizuru sumo grand tournament, part of the traditional sport's spring circuit tour.

At least two women climbed into the dohyo and administered cardiac massage to Tatami.

Members of the committee for the event, consisting of local volunteers, said after the two women spectators started emergency assistance, male ambulance crew members followed and took over.

During the emergency, the women were ordered to leave at least three times in announcements made over the public address system.

The gyoji also said, "Gentlemen, please climb up (to the dohyo)," according to municipal government sources and others.

Tatami was later taken to a hospital by ambulance and was conscious and talking, sources said. He was diagnosed as suffering from a subarachnoid hemorrhage. He is scheduled to undergo surgery and will remain hospitalized.

Some spectators said that after the women left the dohyo, staff associated with the JSA sprinkled a large amount of salt in the ring.

In sumo tournaments, this purification ritual is often conducted before a bout and when a wrestler is injured.

A JSA official told reporters, "We have not confirmed that yet (why the salt was sprinkled). But we don't believe they did it because women climbed into the dohyo."

In 2000, another controversial case involving a woman entering the dohyo became a social issue.

Fusae Ota, then-governor of Osaka Prefecture, hoped to personally present the governor's award to the winning wrestler during the awards ceremony on the closing day of the Spring Grand Sumo Tournament in Osaka.

The JSA, however, showed reluctance to granting her request, and the governor finally gave up.

## Appendix 2: Narrative Structure of the Reports

Narrative structural analyses of the reports based on Bell's (1991) model

### Appendix 2.1: *BBC*

Original Text	Narrative Category
Japanese women ordered from sumo ring during first aid	Abstract: Headline
Women who rushed to perform first aid on a man who collapsed in a sumo ring in Japan were ordered by a referee to leave the ring, because females are banned from the space.	Abstract: Lead
The ring is regarded as sacred and women, traditionally seen as "impure", are forbidden from entering.	Episode: Background History
They ran into the ring	Episode: Event 2 Action
when Maizuru city mayor Ryozo Tatami collapsed while giving a speech.	Episode: Event 1 Action
The head of Japan's sumo association later apologised to the women. "The announcement [to get off the stage] was made by a referee who was upset, but it was an inappropriate act in a situation that involves one's life," Nobuyoshi Hakkaku, the sumo association's chief said in a statement.  "We deeply apologise."	Episode: Event 3 Follow-up Reaction
Local reports later emerged that spectators saw salt being thrown into the ring after the women had left.  In Japanese culture, salt is thrown into the sumo ring before a match to purify it. Some on social media said the gesture implied that the women had "dirtied" the ring. "How rude is it that they threw salt to cleanse the ring after the women went in?" one Japanese Twitter user said.  "This is the response to someone who tried to save a life? I think we'd better sprinkle salt on the head of the sumo association," another added.	Episode: Event 5 Action Background History Follow-up Reaction
Mr Tatami was taken to hospital and is in a stable condition.	Episode: Event 1 Follow-up Consequence

<p>It is not the first time women entering the sumo ring has sparked controversy.</p> <p>In 2000, the then governor of Osaka Fusae Ota asked the sumo association to allow her to enter the ring so she could present a trophy to the champion wrestler, but her request was rejected.</p>	<p>Episode: Background Previous episode</p>
--	---

### Appendix 2.2: *Asahi Shimbun*

Original Text	Narrative Category
Women trying to save mayor's life ordered out of sumo ring	Abstract: Headline
MAIZURU, Kyoto Prefecture--The Japan Sumo Association chairman has apologized after women who were trying to save the life of the mayor, who suddenly collapsed during a sumo event here on April 4, were ordered to leave the dohyo.	Abstract: Lead
Traditionally, women are barred from entering the sumo ring.	Episode: Background History
Hakkaku, Japan Sumo Association chairman, acknowledged that a "gyoji" (referee) who belongs to the JSA announced over the public address system more than once, "Ladies, please leave the dohyo."  "We would like to offer a profound apology. This instruction was inappropriate under such life-and-death circumstances. The gyoji did it because he was upset," Hakkaku said.	Episode: Event 3 Follow-up Reaction Action
Ryozo Tatami, 67, mayor of the city, suddenly collapsed shortly after 2 p.m. while he was making a speech on the dohyo on the occasion of the Maizuru sumo grand tournament, part of the traditional sport's spring circuit tour.	Episode: Event 1 Action Setting Time, place Background History
At least two women climbed into the dohyo and administered cardiac massage to Tatami.	Episode: Event 2 action
Members of the committee for the event, consisting of local volunteers, said after the two women spectators started emergency assistance, male ambulance crew members followed and took over.	Episode: Event 4 Action
During the emergency, the women were ordered to leave at least three times in announcements made over the public address system. The gyoji also said, "Gentlemen, please climb up (to the dohyo)," according to municipal government sources and others.	Episode: Event 3 Action
Tatami was later taken to a hospital by ambulance and was conscious and talking, sources said. He was diagnosed as suffering from a subarachnoid hemorrhage. He is scheduled to undergo surgery and will remain hospitalized.	Episode: Event 1 Follow-up Consequence
Some spectators said that after the women left the dohyo, staff associated with the JSA sprinkled a large amount of salt in the ring.  In sumo tournaments, this purification ritual is often conducted before a bout and when a wrestler is injured.  A JSA official told reporters, "We have not confirmed that yet (why the salt was sprinkled). But we don't believe they did it because women climbed into the dohyo."	Episode: Event 5 Action Background History Follow-up Reaction

<p>In 2000, another controversial case involving a woman entering the dohyo became a social issue. Fusae Ota, then-governor of Osaka Prefecture, hoped to personally present the governor's award to the winning wrestler during the awards ceremony on the closing day of the Spring Grand Sumo Tournament in Osaka.</p> <p>The JSA, however, showed reluctance to granting her request, and the governor finally gave up.</p>	<p>Episode: Background Previous episode</p>
---	---



### Appendix 3: Predication of Social Actors

How individuals are described in the reports (Reisigl and Wodak, 2001, as cited in Richardson, 2007: p. 52-53)

	BBC	Asahi Shimbun
The women who entered the ring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Japanese women</li> <li>• women who rushed to perform aid</li> <li>• the women (4)</li> <li>• someone who tried to save a life</li> <li>• they</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ladies</li> <li>• women spectators</li> <li>• women trying to save mayor's life</li> <li>• at least two women</li> <li>• two women spectators</li> <li>• women who were trying to save the life of the mayor</li> <li>• the women (2)</li> <li>• women</li> </ul>
Women in general	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• women (2)</li> <li>• females</li> <li>• women, traditionally seen as "impure"</li> <li>• women entering the sumo ring</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• women</li> </ul>
The referee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• a referee</li> <li>• a referee who was upset</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• a gyoji (referee), who belongs to the JSA</li> <li>• the gyoji (2)</li> </ul>
Maizuru Mayor Ryoze Tatami	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• a man who collapsed in a sumo ring in Japan</li> <li>• Maizuru city mayor Ryoze Tatami</li> <li>• Mr [<i>sic</i>] Tatami</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• mayor</li> <li>• Ryoze Tatami, mayor of Maizuru, Kyoto Prefecture</li> <li>• the mayor</li> <li>• Ryoze Tatami, 67, mayor of the city</li> <li>• Tatami (2)</li> <li>• he (2)</li> </ul>
JSA Chairman Nobuyoshi Hakkaku	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the head of Japan's sumo association</li> <li>• Nobuyoshi Hakkaku, the sumo association's chief</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the Japan Sumo Association Chairman</li> <li>• Hakkaku, Japan Sumo Association Chairman</li> <li>• Hakkaku</li> </ul>
Osaka Governor Fusae Ota	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• then governor of Osaka Fusae Ota</li> <li>• her (2)</li> <li>• she</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fusae Ota, then-governor of Osaka Prefecture</li> <li>• her</li> <li>• the governor</li> </ul>

## Appendix 4: News Values Definitions

Definitions of news values from Galtung and Ruge (1965), Bell (1991), and Harcup and O'Neill (2001)

Term	Definition
frequency	Events with a frequency similar to that of the news medium are more likely to be reported.
absolute intensity/ superlativeness/ magnitude	Extreme or sensational events are more newsworthy.
intensity increase	The more extreme events become, the more reportable they are.
unambiguity	A clear cut story is more favorable.
facticity	Hard facts and figures make for better news stories.
cultural proximity/ proximity	News is more valuable if it happens nearby.
relevance	News is more valuable if it happens in a location that is familiar and similar to one's own country.
recency	News that just happened is more important.
predictability	Events that are pre-scheduled are more likely to be covered.
demand/ consonance/ entertainment	People enjoy reading about news that conforms to their preconceptions and expectations.
unpredictability/ unexpectedness/ surprise	Novel events are more newsworthy.
scarcity	Events that are rare make better news.
continuity/ follow-ups	Once a story has been in the news, it tends to stay in the news as it develops further.
composition/ media agenda	News is more likely to be reported if it fits as the type of story the newspaper needs at the time.
reference to elite nations/ eliteness/ the power elite	Events that happen in powerful nations are deemed more newsworthy.
reference to elite people	Events that involve powerful people are deemed more newsworthy.
attribution	Sources that are elite have a higher value.
celebrity	Stories involving people who are already famous are more important.
personification/ personalization	Stories that are more personal and less abstract are more reportable.
reference to something negative/ negativity/ bad news	Negative news is more interesting than positive news.
good news	Stories that are especially positive are worthy of being reported.
competition	Reporters hope to get exclusive scoops that others have not reported yet.
co-option	Smaller stories can get reported if they are mildly related to a high-profile story.
prefabrication	News that can easily be turned into a story is more reportable than news that requires more research.

